PURCHASE CELL
DIRECTORATE GENERAL HEALTH
SERVICES PUNJAB
24-COOPER ROAD, LAHORE

Primary & Secondary
Healthcare Department

Phone No.: +924299201145 Purchase Cell E-mail: pcdghslahore@gmail.com

MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL COMMITTEE HELD ON 07-01- 2020 AT 11.00 A.M TO REDRESS THE GRIEVANCES OF THE FIRMS AGAINST RFP EVALUATION REPORT OF PHARMACEUTICAL MANUFACTURERS & SOLE AGENTS OF FOREIGN PRINCIPLES FOR PURCHASE OF DRUGS FOR FY 2019-2020, FOR DIRECTORATE GENERAL HEALTH SERVICES, PUNJAB

A meeting of the Grievance Redressal Committee was held on 07-01-2020 at 11.00 A.M in committee room of Directorate General Health Services, Punjab, to address the grievances of the applicants, as per Rule 67 of Punjab Procurement Rules, 2014 (Amended), for RFP/Bidding of pharmaceutical manufacturers & sole agents of foreign principles for purchase of drugs/medicines for FY 2019-2020.

Following members of Grievance Redressal Committee attended the meeting:

Sr. No.	Participants	
1.	Director Health Services CD &EPC,DGHS	**Chairman/Convener**
2.	Director Pharmacy DGHS	**Member**
3.	Senior Law Officer DGHS	**Member**

Following member(s) of the Technical evaluation committee presented the cases on behalf of the Technical Committee:

Sr. No.	Member(s)
1.	Additional Director Health Services Stats (MIS), DGHS
2.	Tender Coordination Officer-I P& SHD
3.	Pharmacist M& E, DGHS

The Chair welcomed all the participants and briefed about agenda of meeting i.e. Grievance Redressal of firms against Technical evaluation report of pharmaceutical manufacturers & sole agents of foreign principles for purchase of medicines for Fiscal Year 2019-2020 by DGHS.

<table>
<tr><th>Sr. No.</th><th>Firm Name</th><th>T.E. No.</th><th>TER Status</th><th>Grievance of the Firm</th><th>Decision of the Committee</th></tr>
<tr><td>1</td><td>Wilshire Laboratories (Pvt.) Limited</td><td>4,7,8,14,21,27,41,44,46,50,57,58</td><td>Non-Responsive</td><td>Reference to your Technical Evaluation Report dated 16-12-2019 Wilshire Laboratories (Pvt.) Limited has been declared technically Responsive for the below mentioned products but marks have not been awarded for different criteria such as Experience in Private sector, Public sector, Real Time and Accelerated Stability Study. The chart detailing the categories for which marks have not been awarded is attached.
Tender Sr # Generic Name
4 Diclofenac Sodium injection 75mg/3ml
7 Ciprofloxacin HCl tab 500mg
8 Ciprofloxacin HCL injection 200mg/100ml
14 Ceftriaxone Sodium injection 1gm
21 Amlodipine (as Besylate) tab 5mg
27 Omeprazole caps 20mg
41 Misoprostol tab 200mcg
44 Montelukast Sodium tab 10mg
46 Atenolol tab 50mg
50 Tranexamic Acid 500mg per 5ml
57 Cefixime caps 400mg
58 Cefixime suspension 100mg/5ml
It is most respectfully submitted that documents evidencing that Wilshire fulfilled all the above mentioned criteria have been submitted at the Online Portal of the Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department. Furthermore, all the aforementioned documents were also filed in the paper-based hardcopy of the Technical Proposal. We are again submitting the documents for your kind perusal and review.

In light of the foregoing you are most respectfully and humbly requested to grant required marks for the above mentioned categories after review of the online submitted documents as well as paper-based hardcopy of the Technical Proposal.</td><td>Mr. Qamar from Wilshire Laboratories (Pvt.) Limited attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report.

Firm's claim regarding public sector sale of item no 14 (Triax Injection) and item no. 4 (Zwitter Injection) were accepted hence 10 marks instead of 0 allotted in this category for both items and firm status remained responsive. Firm claim regarding itm no 58 cefixime suspension & item no. 27 Benzim Capsule 20mg was accepted hence grievance of the firm accepted hence grievance of the firm accepted in this regard for these 2 items.
For Item no 7(Quash tablet), Item no 8 (Quash Infusion), Item no 27 (Bemzim Cpsules), Item no 21 (Caprinza tablet), Item no 41 (Zivus tablet), Item no 44 (Tair Tablets), Item no 46 (Zamcil tablet), Item no 50 (Xavene Injection), Item no 57 (Secure Capsule) and Item no 58 (Secure Suspension) firm submitted real time stability and accelerated stability data was was found acceptable hence grievance of the firm was accepted and 1mark for accelerated study and 1 mark for real time stability was allocated for these items.
For Item no 7(Quash tablet), Item no 8 (Quash Infusion), , Item no 21 (Caprinza tablet), Item no 44 (Tair Tablets), Item no 46 (Zamcil tablet), Item no 50 (Xavene Injection) & Item no 57 (Secure Capsule) firm claim of private sale was not confirmed hence grievance of the firm is rejected and decision of technical committee was upheld.
During the course of meeting it was also observed that in technical evaluation report 10 marks wrongly allocated for API source instead of 5 for following items and after correction changed marks and status of said items were as follows.
<table><tr><th>Item no.</th><th></th><th>Wrong allocated Marks</th><th>Correct Marks for API</th><th>Marks granted for Private sect</th><th>2 Marks allocated for stabi</th><th>Total Marks after correction</th><th>Item Status after correction and</th></tr></table></td></tr>
</table>

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee								
										or sale	lity Data		allocation of marks for Stability Data	
						21	Caprinza Tablet 5mg	10	5		2	39	Non Responsive	
						57	Secure Capsule 400 mg	10	5		2	39	Non Responsive	
						1	Paracetamol Tablet 500 mg	10	5		2	39	Non Responsive	
						27	Benzim Capsule 20mg	10	5	5	2	42	Responsive	
						7	Quash Tablet 500 mg	10	5		2	39	Non Responsive	
						58	Secure Susp	10	5	5	2	42	Responsive	

<table>
<tr><th>Sr. No.</th><th>Firm Name</th><th>T.E. No.</th><th>TER Status</th><th>Grievance of the Firm</th><th>Decision of the Committee</th></tr>
<tr><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>
<table>
<tr><td></td><td>ensi on 100 mg/ 5ml</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td>4</td><td>Zwit ter Injec tion</td><td>-</td><td>-</td><td></td><td>2</td><td>44</td><td>Resp onsi ve</td></tr>
<tr><td>14</td><td>Triax Injec tion</td><td>-</td><td>-</td><td></td><td>2</td><td>44</td><td>Resp onsi ve</td></tr>
<tr><td>8</td><td>Quas h Infus ion</td><td>-</td><td>-</td><td></td><td>2</td><td>44</td><td>Resp onsi ve</td></tr>
<tr><td>44</td><td>Tire Tab.</td><td>-</td><td>-</td><td></td><td>2</td><td>44</td><td>Resp onsi ve</td></tr>
<tr><td>46</td><td>Zam acil Tabl et</td><td>-</td><td>-</td><td></td><td>2</td><td>44</td><td>Resp osiv e</td></tr>
</table>
</td></tr>
<tr><td>2</td><td>Sanofi-Aventis Pakistan limited</td><td>25</td><td>Does not Comply with advertised specificatio nNon-Responsive</td><td>Reference to Your Evaluation Report Dated 16-12-19. In that report we were fail to understand that our product Metronidazole 500mg | 100ml infusion item no.179 is not responsive because our item does not comply with advertised specification even we are complied with compulsory criteria and also we scored 58 marks out of 70 total marks. Sir, in your revised RFP your specification was written as ‘’Inf. Metronidazole 500mg/100ml, pack of 100ml, packed in carton with leaflet and hanger. (In case of poly pack the firm shall submit Undertaking on Rs. 100 legally notarized Judicial Stamp Paper to the effect that material used in manufacturing of poly pack is of pharmaceutical grade and free from DEHP or other hazardous plasticizer and source is not re-used/crushed material. The firm shall also provide trail (GD & Invoice</td><td>Mr. Munim from M/s Sanofi-Aventis Pakistan limited attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report and decided that item no. 25 will be re advertised with revised specification.</td></tr>
</table>

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				from January 2018 onward) of pharmaceutical grade material used in poly pack. Moreover, the firm shall submit certificate from manufacturer of poly pack material that material is of pharmaceutical grade and free from DEHP or other hazardous plasticizer and source is not re-used/crushed material''. So Sir, it is requested you that the last year item specification was the same for glass bottle. We qualified and supplied to your department. If the specification did not change, please revised your evaluation and qualified us for the best competition.	
3	CITI PHARMA		Non-Responsive	With reference to subject cited above, we would like to draw your attention toward following grievance. 1. The TEC has objected that we had not uploaded bidding documents on website. In this regard it is stated that we had uploaded our bidding documents on website but unfortunately it was not done due to some technical error in uploading. Also we had submitted hard copy with CDR's of the bidding documents within stipulated time. 2. In view of the above submission we requested you to kindly accept our grievance and our firm may very kindly be evaluated by giving up permission to upload bidding documents for online submission.	Mr. Azhar Ghouri from M/s Citi Pharma attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report GRC decided that online application is compulsory and mandatory knock down clause of technical evaluation criteria and firm did not apply online and fail to fulfill this clause. Furthermore. firm did not register any complaint regrading malfunctioning of online portal nor provided any documentary evidence of malfunction of online portal hence grievance of the firm was rejected and decisions of Technical Evaluation Committee was upheld and firm status remained **Non-Responsive.**
4	Herbion Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd		Non-Responsive	This is with reference to the received concerns against application of Directorate General Health Services (DGHS) Lahore Tender 2019 – 2020. We would like to inform that Herbion International is a dynamic global business that focuses on inventive research to produce herbal and therapeutic preparations. Throughout our 35 years of service, we successfully managed to grow our operations in 24 countries with over 44 formulations. Herbion is manufacturing and exporting its quality products for local and international market. We have applied for tender participation in DGHS tender for current year and received concerns against submitted documents that it was not received on the online portal. None of the documents were found uploaded on the provided forum. This is to declare that we have already uploaded the relevant documents for each clause mention in criteria on the provided website link but the results of the Technical bid evaluation fail to show Herbion's presence on the	Mr. Malik Bashir Ahmed from M/s Herbion Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report GRC decided that online application is compulsory and mandatory knock down clause of technical evaluation criteria and firm did not apply online and fail to fulfill this clause. Furthermore. firm did not register any complaint regrading malfunctioning of online portal nor provided any documentary evidence of malfunction of online portal hence grievance of the firm was rejected, and decisions of Technical Evaluation Committee was upheld, and firm status remained **Non-Responsive**.

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				website link. Therefore, we would like to submit the grievance against the system flaws for your kind consideration. The purchase receipt No. 03598 – (Dated: 29th Oct' 2019) We hope this will suffice your requirements.	
5	BARRETT HODGSON PAKISTAN (PRIVATE) LTD.	2	Paracetamol suspension 125mg/5ml. Non-Responsive	The Director General Health Services Punjab, Directorate General Health Services Punjab, 24- Cooper Road, Lahore Subject: Grievance against Technical Evaluation Report of DRUGS/MEDICINES for FY 2019-2020. We Barrett Hodgson Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd are established and reputable manufacturer of pharmaceuticals products and having good alliance with government /semi government & autonomous institutions for the supply of the quoted products for consumers with best results to fulfill their requirements. We Barrett Hodgson Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd participated in DGHS tender for DRUGS/MEDICINES for FY 2019-20. We are declared non responsive for Paracetamol suspension 125mg/5ml (T.E# 2) due to following points: 1) Waste Water Treatment Plant (attach copy of layout plan and SOPs) 2) Dedicated Reefer Container Supply 3) Primary Reference Standard 4)Total Number of Pharmacist 5)Accelerated Stability Study 6) Supply of the quoted product in PUBLIC sector We have attached all the above documents in tender along with technical bid, detail is given below: >Waste water layout with Sop >TCS & LEOPARD Agreement >COA against Primary Reference Standard >Technical staff data (pharmacist +degrees) >Accelerated stability reports >Data of public sector supply meeting the criteria We request your kind attention to review and accept the Grievance of Barrett Hodgson Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd and declare the firm RESPONSIVE in technical evaluation report. We once again assure you our services to your organization and ensure to maintain our quality standards for further as well. We will be obliged. M/S BARRETT HODGSON PAKISTAN (PVT) LTD	Mr. Shahzad Adnan from M/s BARRETT HODGSON PAKISTAN (PRIVATE) LTD attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report GRC decided that Firm claim regrading FDA approval of API Source for Paracetamol Suspension was verified from official website of FDA hence 10 marks granted for API source category of Paracetamol Suspension, Firm attached documents for Wastewater Plant found acceptable hence 3 marks granted for this category Firm did not provide appointment letters and salary slips of Pharmacist as per advertised marking criteria of bidding documents along with degrees hence grievance of firm rejected for this parameter Firm did not provide required undertaking regarding refer container as per advertised marking criteria of bidding documents hence grievance firm rejected for this parameter. Total Marks for Paracetamol Suspension become 41 however, status remained **Non-Responsive.** .
6	OBS Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd	19,23	Non Compliance Item Clause No. 7 (GMP) &	It is stated with profound respect that we come to know that our company is not been qualified due to absence of some technical documents. Whenever the same was submitted along-with the tender submission. We are re-submitting the missing documents with the request that accept the same & clearance of grievance may please be	Mr. Munim Khan from M/s OBS Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report GRC decided that Firm provided the GMP Certificate which was not valid and expired on November 7, 2019 hence grievance of the firm was rejected for this parameter. Firm

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
			8 (Non-Declaration of any Spurious	given We regret all the inconvenience in this regard, we remain, Sincerely yours OBS Pakistan (Pvt) Limited	did not provide required undertaking regarding spurious/adulterated as per advertised knockdown criteria of bidding documents instead provided undertaking is for last 3 years only hence grievance firm rejected for this parameter, status of quoted items of M/s OBS remained **Non-Responsive.**
7	CCL Pharmaceuticals Pvt Ltd.	29	Non Compliance Item Clause No. 8 (Specifications)	It is stated with profound respect that we come to know that our company is not been qualified in PULMONOL SYRUP (AMMOUNIUM CHOLRIDE + CPM+ MENTHOL AND OTHER SYRUP) 120ML) due to absence of some technical documents. Whenever the same was submitted along-with the tender submission. We are re-submitting the missing documents with the request that accept the same & clearance of grievance may please be given We regret all the inconvenience in this regard, we remain, Sincerely yours OBS Pakistan (Pvt) Limited	Representative of M/s CCL Pharmaceuticals Pvt Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report GRC decided that the Drug Regulatory Authority of Pakistan granted the registration of Pulmonal Syrup without leaflet and spoon but submitted undertaking for provision of both. hence grievance of the firm was accepted however marks will be remained same as per TER i.e. 46 and status of item no 29 (Pulmonol syp.) changed to **Responsive.**
8	Bio Labs (pvt) Ltd	14,21,44,58	Non compliance for item Ceftriaxone 1gm IV, Amlodipine 5mg tab, Montelukast 10mg tab • Cefixime 100mg/5ml susp	It is submitted that the firm was declared not responsive for following Items. • Ceftriaxone 1gm IV (Sr#37, PQ#81, T.E#14) • Amlodipine 5mg tab (Sr#39, PQ#17, T.E#21) • Montelukast 10mg tab (Sr#40, PQ#234, T.E#44) • Cefixime 100mg/5ml susp (Sr#41, PQ#79, T.E#58) The Firm is requesting for the review as detailed below. Ceftriaxone 1gm IV (Sr#37, PQ#81, T.E#14) • Experience of the quoted product Pvt Sector (100% for eligibility of 10 marks award); As quoted item has Private sector sales much more than 100% of advertised quantity of 30,00,000 units. Please find the IMS letter showing the sales of 41,25,171 units from Jan 2018 to Sep2019 period. Kindly review & award the product 10 marks against the said parameter. (Encl; IMS Letter) • Valid international Reputed Certification; Bio-Labs is the only manufacturer is Pakistan submitting the PIC/S certification, subsequently being awarded the GMP COMPLIANCE Certificate by Philippines FDA because of the on-site inspection consistency with PIC/S guides. Kindly endorse by awarding 3 marks in said parameter. (Encl; FDA Certificate of PIC/S compliance) • Waste Water Treatment Plant; The firm attached the copy of layout plan & SOP. However, no marks were awarded for this parameter. The firms offer the visit of Committee constituted by procuring agency to validate the claim. Kindly review to award 3 marks as per criteria. (Enlc; Original picture of Water Treatment Plant) Amlodipine 5mg tab (Sr#39,	Mr. Khurram Shazad from M/s Bio Labs (Pvt.) Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report GRC.Firm attached documents for Wastewater Plant found acceptable hence 3 marks granted for this category Firm Claim regarding PIC/S certification, by Philippines FDA is not acceptable because Philippines FDA is not included/verified from LIST OF PIC/S PARTICIPATING AUTHORITIES list on official website of PICS hence grievance of the firm is rejected in this regard. Firm claim regrading private sector sales for quoted item no 14 Tuff injection 1 gm earned only 3 mark (Cumulative sale of strength other than quoted item are not acceptable) hence grievance of the firm is rejected in this regard. Firm claim regrading private sector sales for quoted item no 58 Biozil suspension earned only 3 marks (Cumulative sale of strength other than quoted item are not acceptable) hence grievance of the firm is accepted in this regard to the extent of private sector sales parameter. Firm claim regrading private sector sales for quoted item no 21 AMDOL 5mg tablet could not be verified hence grievance of the firm is rejected in this regard

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				PQ#17, T.E#21) • Valid international Reputed Certification; Bio-Labs is the only manufacturer is Pakistan submitting the PIC/S certification, subsequently being awarded the GMP COMPLIANCE Certificate by Philippines FDA because of the on-site inspection consistency with PIC/S guides. Kindly endorse by awarding 3 marks in said parameter. (Encl; FDA Certificate of PIC/S compliance) • Waste Water Treatment Plant; The firm attached the copy of layout plan & SOP. However, no marks were awarded for this parameter. The firms offer the visit of Committee constituted by procuring agency to validate the claim. Kindly review to award 3 marks as per criteria (Enlc; Original picture of Water Treatment Plant) Montelukast 10mg tab (Sr#40, PQ#234, T.E#44) • Valid international Reputed Certification; Bio-Labs is the only manufacturer is Pakistan submitting the PIC/S certification, subsequently being awarded the GMP COMPLIANCE Certificate by Philippines FDA because of the on-site inspection consistency with PIC/S guides. Kindly endorse by awarding 3 marks in said parameter. (Encl; FDA Certificate of PIC/S compliance) • Waste Water Treatment Plant; The firm attached the copy of layout plan & SOP. However, no marks were awarded for this parameter. The firms offer the visit of Committee constituted by procuring agency to validate the claim. Kindly review to award 3 marks as per criteria (Enlc; Original picture of Water Treatment Plant) Cefixime 100mg/5ml susp (Sr#41, PQ#79, T.E#58) • Experience of the quoted product Pvt/Public Sector (50% for award of 5 marks Each); as quoted item has Public sector sales of 62% & Private sector sales of 52% against the advertised quantity of 500000 units. The same was claimed on judicial stamp paper & detailed sales summary was duly submitted. Even the IMS data reflects the Market sales making above 50% against the advertised quantity. Kindly review to award 5+5 Marks in this parameter. (Encl; IMS Letter) • Valid international Reputed Certification; Bio-Labs is the only manufacturer is Pakistan submitting the PIC/S certification, subsequently being awarded the GMP COMPLIANCE Certificate by Philippines FDA because of the on-site inspection consistency with PIC/S guides. Kindly endorse by awarding 3 marks in said parameter.	Firm claim regrading private sector sales for quoted item no 44 MONEST 10mg tablet could not be verified hence grievance of the firm is rejected in this regard After addition of 3 marks for wastewater treatment plant item no. 14 Tuff injection 1 gm and 6 marks (Private sector sales + Wastewater treatment plant) item no. 58 Biozil Suspension attained passing marks and became responsive. However, status of item no. **21 and 44 (Amlodipine & Montelukast) remained unchanged and Non-Responsive.**

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				(Encl; FDA Certificate of PIC/S compliance) • Waste Water Treatment Plant; The firm attached the copy of layout plan & SOP. However, no marks were awarded for this parameter. The firms offers the visit of Committee constituted by procuring agency to validate the claim. Kindly review to award 3 marks as per criteria (Enlc; Original picture of Water Treatment Plant)	
9	THE SEARLE COMPANY LIMITED	3,44 & 27	Noncompliance of items DICLOFENAC SODIU 50MG, OMEPRAZOLE 20MG & MONTELUKAST SODIUM 10MG.	The Searle Company Limited quoted the advertised product by you, the quoted products are high value product since its marketing but due to some confusion evaluation committee has observed that some technical documents are missing whenever we have submitted on the time of submission of the tender documents against the requirements we are re-submitting the following documents. Therefore, it is stated under**: 1- Public & Private Sales. 2- Waste water treatment SOP 3- Real Time Stability Study. 4- Primary Reference standard 5- Undertaking of our Technical staff.** Kindly accept our grievance and qualify us.	Mr. Munim Khan from M/s The Searle Company Ltd. attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report GRC decided that Firm claim regrading FDA approval of API Source for item no. 3 (Defnac tablet 50 mg) & item no 44 (Ventek tablet 10 mg) was verified from official website of FDA hence 10 marks granted for API source category of both items. However, item no. 27 (Lovanzo capsule 20 mg) FDA approval of API source was not verified Firm claim regrading private sector sales for quoted item no**.** 3 (Defnac tablet 50 mg), item no 44 (Ventek tablet 10 mg) & item no. 27 (Lovanzo capsule 20 mg) could not be verified hence grievance of the firm was rejected in this regard. Firm provides G.D/invoices for purchase of primary reference standard of quoted items as per requirement of advertised marking criteria of bidding documents hence grievance of the firm was rejected for this parameter. Firm submitted stability data is not of stipulated time period i.e January 2018 to onward as per requirement of advertised marking criteria of bidding documents hence grievance of the firm was rejected for this parameter. Firm submitted layout plan of wastewater treatment plant/SOP not as per requirement of advertised marking criteria of bidding documents hence grievance of the firm was rejected for this parameter. Firm did not provide degree, appointment letters and salary slips of Pharmacist as per advertised marking criteria of bidding documents along with degrees hence grievance firm rejected for this parameter The status of quoted items remained **Non Responsive.**

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
10	PharmEvo (Pvt) Ltd.	44 & 57	Noncompliance of items Tablet Aireez 10mg and Evofix Capsule 400mg	With reference to the result of Technical Evaluation (uploaded by the department) on 16-12-2019 wherein our items Tablet Aireez 10mg and Evofix Capsule 400mg bearing tender Serial # 44 & 57 have been declared as Non-responsive not complied with the specification of advertised tender. We would like to submit that DRAP approved our product with same pack size and we are marketing these items with the pack of 30's and pack of 10's respectively. DRAP approval letter are attached for favorable consideration. It is further requested that department not given 3 marks in the criteria of sales as we have sale of more than 25%. we are attaching IMS letter to strengthen our claim. Keeping in view of above it is requested to accept our request for pack size and allow us to participate in financial opening for better competition and purchase of high-quality medicine. Hoping for a favorable consideration, we remain	Mr. Abdul Hafeez from M/s Pharm Evo (Pvt) Ltd. attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report GRC decided that offered specifications (Pack size) of item 44 (Aireez 10 mg) and item 57 (Evofix Capsule) are different form advertised specification hence grievance of the firm was rejected and status of the firm remained **Non Responsive.**
11	Amson Vaccines and Pharma (Private) Ltd	21,27, 44, 45 & 52	Non-compliance of Item Ferrous salt + Folic Acid Capsule/Tablets, Amlodipine Tablets 5 mg, Montelukast Tablets 10 mg, Montelukast Tablets 10 mg & Anti-Snake venom Serum (ASV)	Refer to your Evaluation Report of our Technical Bid in which our quoted items are declared non-responsive due to less marks obtained than qualifying marks. In this regard, our humble submissions are as under for your kind consideration: SR # 6 (T.E # 52) Ferrous Salt + Folic Acid Tabs. (Fefan Tabs.) Marks obtained: 41 a) WASTE WATER TREATMENT PLANT: (Please See at Annex-1) Please note that we have installed Waste Water Treatment Plant in our manufacturing unit. (Kindly award 3 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Layout Plan of Waste Water Treatment Plant • SOPs. • Purchase Record. • Physical Pictures • Installation Record. • Undertaking on Stamp Paper to visit our manufacturing plant to confirm waste water treatment plant. b) STABILITY CHAMBERS: (Please See at Annex-2) Please note that we have 4 Stability Chambers at our manufacturing plant. (Kindly award 3 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Purchase Record. • Validation Record. • DRAP Inspection Report. • Copy of Undertaking already submitted in our bid. • Further Undertaking on Stamp Paper that we have 4-Stability Chambers and undertaking	Mr. Faisal from M/s Amson Vaccines and Pharma (Private) Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report GRC decided that Firm submitted record for wastewater treatment plant was acceptable hence grievance of the firm was accepted to extent of this parameter and 3 marks were granted for this category. Firm submitted record for 4 stability chambers was acceptable hence grievance of the firm was accepted to extent of this parameter and 3 marks were granted for this category. Firm submitted private sale data for item no. 44 (Airflo tab), item no. 27 (Omepral 20 Capsule), item no. 45 Anti- Snake vemom (ASV), item no. 47 (Neo- Cotexcin) and item no. 35 (Hyzonate 250 mg) not verified hence grieviance of the firm was rejected in this regard. Firm submitted accelerated study data of item no 44 (Airflo tab) & 47 (Neo-Cotexcin) was accepted hence 1 mark granted for this category to item no 44 (Airflo tab) & 47 (Neo- Cotexcin).

<table>
<tr><th>Sr. No.</th><th>Firm Name</th><th>T.E. No.</th><th>TER Status</th><th>Grievance of the Firm</th><th>Decision of the Committee</th></tr>
<tr><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>to visit our manufacturing plant for confirmation. c) PRIMARY REFERENCE STANDARDS: (Please See at Annex-3) We have the primary reference standard of Folic Acid. For Ferrous Fumarate Titration Method is used. (Kindly award 2 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Reference from official site of British Pharmacopia • Picture of primaray refrence standard. • Purchase Invoice. • Certificate of Analysis. • GD is enclosed It is also requested that we have not hired the services of IMS. So kindly consider our attached invoices as verifiable documents. So the Total Marks will be : 49_____ SR # 8 (T.E # 44) Montelukast 10mg Tabs. (Airflo Tabs.) Marks obtained: 30 d) SALE IN PRIVATE SECTOR: (Please See at Annex-4) Please note that our Sale in Private Sector is 70% of advertised quantity. (Kindly award _7 Marks). We are enclosing following documents: • Copy of Undertaking on Stamp Paper (already submitted in our bid) • Sales Summary (already submitted in our bid) • Invoices e) WASTE WATER TREATMENT PLANT: (Please See at Annex-1) Please note that we have installed Waste Water Treatment Plant in our manufacturing unit. (Kindly award 3 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Layout Plan of Waste Water Treatment Plant • SOPs. • Purchase Record. • Physical Pictures • Installation Record. • Undertaking on Stamp Paper to visit our manufacturing plant to confirm waste water treatment plant. f) STABILITY CHAMBERS (Please See at Annex-2) Please note that we have 4 Stability Chambers at our manufacturing plant. (Kindly award 3 Marks) following documents: • Purchase Record. • Validation Record. • DRAP Inspection Report. • Copy of Undertaking already submitted in our bid. • Further Undertaking on Stamp Paper that we have 4-Stability Chambers and undertaking to visit our manufacturing plant for confirmation g) ACCELERATED STABILITY STUDY REPORT (Please See at Annex-5) We are enclosing the Accelerated Stability Study Report. (Kindly award 1 Mark) It is also requested that we have not hired the services of IMS. So kindly consider our attached invoices as verifiable documents. So the Total Marks will be : ____44__ SR # 9 (T.E # 27) Omperazole 20mg Caps. (Omepral Caps.) Marks obtained: 31 h) SALE IN PRIVATE SECTOR: (Please See at</td><td>Firm claim regarding primary reference standard for item no. 45 Anti- Snake vemom (ASV) that it is manufactured form regional snake species hence only working reference standards are available hence 2 marks were awarded in this category. Furthermore, primary reference data submitted for item no. 47 (Neo- Cotexcin), item no. 35 (Hyzonate 250 mg) and item not 52 (Fefan Tab) were also accepted and 2 marks granted for this parameters to these quoted items.

Status of quoted item changed after grievance as follows.

<table>
<tr><th>Item no.</th><th>Quoted item</th><th>Added Marks for waste water plant</th><th>Added marks for stability Chamber</th><th>Added Marks for stability studies data</th><th>Added Marks for Refrence standard</th><th>Total marks after grievance</th><th>Status of quoted item after grievance</th></tr>
<tr><td>44</td><td>Airflo tab</td><td>3</td><td>3</td><td>1</td><td>-</td><td>37</td><td>Non responsive</td></tr>
<tr><td>52</td><td>Fefan Tab.</td><td>3</td><td>3</td><td>-</td><td>2</td><td>49</td><td>Responsive</td></tr>
<tr><td>27</td><td>Omepral 20 Tab.</td><td>3</td><td>3</td><td>-</td><td>-</td><td>37</td><td>Non Responsive</td></tr>
</table>
</td></tr>
</table>

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				Annex-4) Please note that our Sale in Private Sector is 75 % of advertised quantity. (Kindly award _7 Marks). We are enclosing following documents: • Copy of Undertaking on Stamp Paper (already submitted in our bid) • Sales Summary (already submitted in our bid) • Invoices i) WASTE WATER TREATMENT PLANT: (Please See at Annex-1) Please note that we have installed Waste Water Treatment Plant in our manufacturing unit. (Kindly award 3 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Layout Plan of Waste Water Treatment Plant • SOPs. • Purchase Record. • Physical Pictures • Installation Record. • Undertaking on Stamp Paper to visit our manufacturing plant to confirm waste water treatment plant. j) STABILITY CHAMBERS (Please See at Annex-2) Please note that we have 4 Stability Chambers at our manufacturing plant. (Kindly award 3 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Purchase Record. • Validation Record. • DRAP Inspection Report. • Copy of Undertaking already submitted in our bid. • Further Undertaking on Stamp Paper that we have 4-Stability Chambers and undertaking to visit our manufacturing plant for confirmation. It is also requested that we have not hired the services of IMS. So kindly consider our attached invoices as verifiable documents. So the Total Marks will be: ___44___ SR # 10 (T.E # 45) Anti-Snake Venom (ASV) (Polyvalent) Marks obtained: 41 k) SALE IN PRIVATE SECTOR: (Please See at Annex-4) Please note that our Sale in Private Sector is higher than advertised quantity. (Kindly award 10 Marks). We are enclosing following documents: • Please note IMS does not collect data of ASVS. • Copy of Undertaking on Stamp Paper (already submitted in our bid) • Sales Summary (already submitted in our bid) • Invoices l) WASTE WATER TREATMENT PLANT: (Please See at Annex-1) Please note that we have installed Waste Water Treatment Plant in our manufacturing unit. (Kindly award 3 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Layout Plan of Waste Water Treatment Plant • SOPs. • Purchase Record. • Physical Pictures • Installation Record. • Undertaking on Stamp Paper to visit our manufacturing plant to confirm waste water treatment plant. m) STABILITY CHAMBERS: (Please See at Annex-2) Please note that we have 4 Stability Chambers at our	45 ASV 3 3 - 2 49 Responsive 47 Neo-Cotexcin 3 3 1 2 39 Non Responsive 35 Hyzonate 250 mg 3 3 - 2 54 Responsive

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				manufacturing plant. (Kindly award 3 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Purchase Record. • Validation Record. • DRAP Inspection Report. • Copy of Undertaking already submitted in our bid. • Further Undertaking on Stamp Paper that we have 4-Stability Chambers and undertaking to visit our manufacturing plant for confirmation. n) WORKING REFERENCE STANDARDS: (Please See at Annex-3) In ASVS case there is no primary reference standard. Working standard is enclosed for your reference. (Kindly award 2 Marks) So the Total Marks will be : ____59__ SR # 11 (T.E # 47) Artemether + Lumefantrine 20/120mg Tabs. (Neo-Cotexcin Tabs.) Marks obtained: 30 o) SALE IN PRIVATE SECTOR: (Please See at Annex-4) Please note that our Sale in Private Sector is higher than advertised quantity. (Kindly award _10 Marks). We are enclosing following documents: • Copy of Undertaking on Stamp Paper (already submitted in our bid) • Sales Summary (already submitted in our bid) • Invoices p) WASTE WATER TREATMENT PLANT: (Please See at Annex-1) Please note that we have installed Waste Water Treatment Plant in our manufacturing unit. (Kindly award 3 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Layout Plan of Waste Water Treatment Plant • SOPs. • Purchase Record. • Physical Pictures • Inspection Report of DRAP. • Undertaking on Stamp Paper to visit our manufacturing plant to confirm waste water treatment plant. q) STABILITY CHAMBERS (Please See at Annex-2) Please note that we have 4 Stability Chambers at our manufacturing plant. (Kindly award 3 Marks) following documents: • Purchase Record. • Validation Record. • DRAP Inspection Report. • Copy of Undertaking already submitted in our bid. • Further Undertaking on Stamp Paper that we have 4-Stability Chambers and undertaking to visit our manufacturing plant for confirmation r) ACCELERATED STABILITY STUDY REPORT (Please See at Annex-5) We are enclosing the Accelerated Stability Study Report. (Kindly award 1 Mark) s) PRIMARY REFERENCE STANDARDS: (Please See at Annex-3) We have the primary reference standard of Lumefantrine (Kindly award 1 Marks) It is also requested that we have not hired the services of IMS. So kindly consider our attached invoices as verifiable	

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				documents. So the Total Marks will be: 48_____ SR # 12 (T.E # 35) Hydrocortisone Inj. 250mg (Hyzonate) Marks obtained: 46 t) SALE IN PRIVATE SECTOR: (Please See at Annex-4) Please note that our Sale in Private Sector is 85 % of advertised quantity. (Kindly award _7 Marks). We are enclosing following documents: • Copy of Undertaking on Stamp Paper (already submitted in our bid) • Sales Summary (already submitted in our bid) • Invoices u) WASTE WATER TREATMENT PLANT: (Please See at Annex-1) Please note that we have installed Waste Water Treatment Plant in our manufacturing unit. (Kindly award 3 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Layout Plan of Waste Water Treatment Plant • SOPs. • Purchase Record. • Physical Pictures • Inspection Report of DRAP. • Undertaking on Stamp Paper to visit our manufacturing plant to confirm waste water treatment plant. v) STABILITY CHAMBERS: (Please See at Annex-2) Please note that we have 4 Stability Chambers at our manufacturing plant. (Kindly award 3 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Purchase Record. • Validation Record. • DRAP Inspection Report. • Copy of Undertaking already submitted in our bid. • Further Undertaking on Stamp Paper that we have 4-Stability Chambers and undertaking to visit our manufacturing plant for confirmation. w) PRIMARY REFERENCE STANDARDS: (Please See at Annex-3) We have the primary reference standard. (Kindly award 2 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Reference from official site of British Pharmacopeia • Picture of primary reference standard. • Purchase Invoice. • Certificate of Analysis. • It is also requested that we have not hired the services of IMS. So kindly consider our attached invoices as verifiable documents. So the Total Marks will be: ___61___ So, you are requested that above mentioned additional justified marks may please be added in our already awarded marks and declare our above quoted items as Responsive for healthy competition.	
12	Otsuka Pakistan Limited	25-A, 36	Noncompliance of following items	It is submitted that we declared non responsive in two products i.e. Ringolact infusion 1000ml & Metronidazole infusion 100ml, we are hereby submitting you our grievance against knocked out ordinary parameters for review. 1. Ordinary Parameter # 10: We have submitted	Mr. Naeem from M/s Otsuka Pakistan Ltd. attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee.

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
			Metronidazole 500mg/100ml infusion (Poly Pack) Ringer's Lactate (1000ml) Infusion	degrees of 10 pharmacists; however, we are submitting salary slips and appointment letters with degrees again. 2. Ordinary Parameter # 9: We have submitted you shipping documents with COA see pg # 185-294 of submitted technical bid. We are submitting it again. 3. Ordinary Parameter # 4: We have submitted layout and SOP of waste-water treatment plant see pg# 174-176 of submitted technical bid, however we are submitting it again 4. Ordinary Parameter # 3: Metronidazole infusion 100ml; we are hereby submitting public sector's purchase orders for 347,000 units Ringer lactate infusion 1000ml: we are hereby submitting public sector's purchase orders. Moreover, our Metronidazole infusion is pet bottle it doesn't need hanger as it has a hook present on back with a packing of 10 bottles in a carton with leaflet. we have submitted the documents for plastic material as per defined protocol. Your kind support is required	For item no 36 refer to decision of Unisa pharmaceutical industries LTD at serial no. 27. For item no and 25 refer to decision of Sanofi-Aventis Pakistan limited at serial no. 2.
13	Martin Dow Marker Ltd	52,44 & 07	Non-compliance of following Item Ferrous salt + Folic Acid Capsule/Tablets, Montelukast Tablets 10 mg Ciprofloxacin (Hydrochloride) Tablets 500 mg	The Grievances application in response of technically non responsive decision M/s Martin Dow Marker LTD, which is established & reputable manufacturer of pharmaceuticals products & having good alliance with All Government / Semi Government & Autonomous institutions for the supplies of our quality products for consumers with best results to fulfill their requirements. As we were awarded for the supplies to different Government esteemed organizations against the different contracts in Year 2016-17, 2017-18 and even in the year 2018-19, which have been successfully completed with our best level of compliance including Primary and Secondary Health Care Punjab. Keeping in view the summarize introduction of our organization, we would like to submit our Grievances against Technical evolution Reports uploaded on 17-12-201 for the below quoted item as per grievances attached your kind attention for consideration of our grievance by your respected committee against the Technical Evaluation of products, as uploaded is being submitted that all documents were submitted along with the technical documents and also being attached with the grievance for enhancing the confidence of technical committee for the company and products.	Mr. Salauddin from M/s Martin Dow Marker Ltd (Pvt) Ltd. attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report GRC decided that Firm claim regrading FDA approval of API Source for item no. 52 (Sangobion Cap) could not verified for all APIs hence grievance of the firm was rejected for this parameter. for item no. 52 (Sangobion Cap) Firm Public sector sale quantity is more than advertised quantity hence firm's grievance is accepted in this regard and 10 marks granted in private sale category of itme no 52 Firm provided undertaking for 6 stability chambers as per requirement of advertised marking criteria of bidding documents hence grievance of the firm was accepted for this parameter and 6 marks granted for this category Firm provides G.D/invoices for purchase of primary reference standard of quoted items as per requirement of advertised marking criteria of bidding documents hence grievance of the firm was rejected for this parameter.

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				Undermentioned details are for your perusal to amend the technical RESULT for captioned products. Your kind attention to review / acceptance of grievance in favor of M/s Martin Dow Marker Limited, will be highly admired to serve "DG Health Services Punjab" For M/s Martin Dow Marker Limited	Firms submitted stability data was acceptable hence 1 mark granted for real time stability data for item no. **52,44 & 07** For item no. 7 (Mercip 500 mg) provided sales data is verified which is between 75-50% of advertised quantity hence grievance of the firm was accepted, and 5 marks granted in private sale category for item no. 7. Furthermore, firm provided Purchase order for sale of public sector for same item which fall between 25-50% of advertised quantity hence grievance of the firm was also accepted for this parameter hence 3 marks added for this after addition of 6 marks total marks for item no. 7 (Mercip 500 mg) become 42 and status for this item become Responsive. For item no 22 (Glucophage tablet 500MG) Public sector sale quantity is more than advertised quantity hence firm's grievance was accepted in this regard. and 10 marks granted in private sale category of item no 22. Firm submitted undertaking regarding provision of leaflet and 6 stability chamber which is accepted by GRC and 6 marks granted in this category. Firm claim regrading private sale for item no. 44 (Whizix tablet) could not be verified hence firm's grievance is rejected in this regard. The final status quoted for item .52 (Sangobion Cap) & item no. 7 (Mercip 500 mg) changed to **Responsive** after attaining 44 and 42 Marks respectively however item no. 44 (Whizix tablet) status remained unchanged and **Non-Responsive.**
14	AXIS PHARMACEUTICALS	6,60,46, 48,40,27,3 & 29	Non Compliance of following items Ibuprofen Susp. 100mg/5ml Doxycycline (hyclate)	Reference to technical evaluation report for Drugs/ Medicines for Directorate General Health Services Punjab, we are hereby submitting Grievance documents as under. 1- GMP certificate along with Letter from FID-DRAP, Lahore office. 2- Summary of Private sector sales on Rs.100/- Stamp paper. 3- Summary and Supply orders of public sector sales on Rs.100/- Stamp paper. 4- 3 # Functional Stability Chamber undertaking on Rs.100/- Stamp paper. 5- Supply through own source Refer Container undertaking on Rs.100/- Stamp paper. 6- Accelerated stability studies data for 3 Batches. 7- Real time stability studies data for 3 Batches. 8- Import as well as technical documents of Primary reference standards	Mr. Imran from M/s Axis Pharmaceuticals attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report GRC decided that Firm submitted valid undertaking regarding provision of supplies in refer container hence grievance of the firm was accepted, and 3 marks granted for this parameter. Firm submitted data of primary reference standards was acceptable hence 2 marks granted for this category for item no. 6 (Megrofen 100mg/5m

<table>
<tr><th>Sr. No.</th><th>Firm Name</th><th>T.E. No.</th><th>TER Status</th><th>Grievance of the Firm</th><th>Decision of the Committee</th></tr>
<tr><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>Capsules 100mg

Azithromycin Capsules/Tab 250mg

Mefenamic acid Tablet 500 mg

Omeprazole Capsule 20mg

Diclofenac (Sodium) Capsule/Tablets 50 mg

Ammonium Chloride+Aminophylline+Menthol+CPM/Diphenhydramine + others Expectorant Syrup/Susp.

Paracetamol Tablet 500 mg

Metronidazole</td><td>for APIs. 9- Complete record i.e. Appointment letter, Academic certificates (Degree copies) & Salary slips for 10 Pharmacists.</td><td>suspension), item no. 60 (Axidox 100mg), item no. 46 (Tenim 50mg), item no.48 (Hyzith 250mg) item no. 40 (Ponsid Forte 500mg), item no. 27 (Mark-20 20mg), item no. 3 (Axifen 50mg), item no. 1 (Axamol 500mg), item no. 24 (Metrozid 400mg), item no. 47 (Alumax tab.), item no. 7 (Cinolox 500mg) and item no. 44 (Monticel 10mg)

Firm submitted valid undertaking regrading availability of 3 stability chambers in manufacturing units hence grievance of the firm was accepted in this regard and 3 marks granted for this category.

Firm submitted GMP certificate expired on 03-10-2019 and not valid. Which is noncompliance of knockdown clause of advertised bidding criteria. Firm submitted letter for Federal Inspector of Drugs of Drug Regulatory Authority of Pakistan also mentioned that for issuance of GMP certificate prescribed coded requirements including GMP compliance inspection report of Manufacturing Unit is pending. Hence grievance of the firm was rejected.

Firm submitted degree of all employed pharmacist which are acceptable as per requirement of advertised marking criteria of bidding documents. Hence grievance of the firm was accepted for this parameter and 5 marks granted in this category.

Firm submitted stability data for all of its quoted item did not mentioned the temperature and humidity range at which stability studies were carried out which is not acceptable hence, grievance of the firm was rejected.

Firm submitted item was sale data of public and private sector as follows.

<table><tr><td>Item no.</td><td>Quoted item</td><td>Marks for Private sector</td><td>Marks for Public Sector</td></tr></table></td></tr>
</table>

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee			
			Tablets 400 mg Artemether + Lumefantrine Tablets 20mg + 120mg Ciprofloxacin (Hydrochloride) Tablets 500 m Montelukast Tablets 10 mg		29	Deltalin syp	Submitted data not verified hence 0 marks	Between 25-50% of advertised quantity 3 marks granted
					47	Alumax tab	Submitted data not verified hence 0 marks	Between 25-50% of advertised quantity 3 marks granted
					3	Axifen 50mg	Submitted data not verified hence 0 marks	Less than 25% of advertised quantity 0 marks
					60	Axidox 100mg	Submitted data not verified hence 0 marks	Between 25-50% of advertised quantity 3 marks granted
					48	Hyzith 250mg	Submitted data not verified hence 0 marks	Between 25-50% of advertised quantity 3 marks granted

<table>
<tr><th>Sr. No.</th><th>Firm Name</th><th>T.E. No.</th><th>TER Status</th><th>Grievance of the Firm</th><th>Decision of the Committee</th></tr>
<tr><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>
<table>
<tr><td>46</td><td>Tenim 50mg</td><td>Submitted data not verified hence 0 marks</td><td>Between 25-50% of advertised quantity 3 marks granted</td></tr>
</table>

The status of all quoted items remained Non Responsive due to non-provision of valid GMP certificate which is knock down clause of advertised bidding criteria hence firm status for all of its quoted item remained Non-Responsive.</td></tr>
<tr><td>15</td><td>Frontier Dextrose Limited</td><td>36, 8 & 25-A</td><td>Non Compliance of following items

Ringer Lactate. Bottle of 1000ml, Metronidazole 100ml, pack of 100ml, packed. & Ciprofloxacin 200mg/100ml.pack of 100ml</td><td>It is stated for your kind consideration and compliance there to, Initial Scrutiny Points: We have received 33 Marks against Tender Enquiry Number’s i) 36 i.e Ringer Lactate. Bottle of 1000ml, pack of 20 bottles packed in master carton. ii) 25 i.e. Metronidazole 100ml, pack of 100ml, packed in carton without leaflet and with built-in Hanger. iii) 08 i.e. Ciprofloxacin 200mg/100ml.pack of 100ml individually packed in carton without leaflet. Our Answer / Reply: This is worth to mention here that we have quoted our quality products as the specifications mentioned in RFP (Tender Specifications). i) We have submitted our bid through online portal as per the instructions of RFP. Moreover, we have also attached online submission forms along with our bid at page no’s 2-3 but unfortunately your respected Technical Evaluation Committee has mentioned the word “NO” in the Technical Evaluation Report. (Online submissions forms are once again attached with this letter as Annex-A for your reference) ii) We have received 0 marks against Point No 02 of RFP which states that “Experience of quoted product Since January 2018 till closing date of RFP submission”. Please note that we have attached summary of our quoted products equivalent than advertised quantity regarding Private Sector as per the requirement of RFP and the same was mentioned at page no’s 135-140 in our bid. (Copy of the same is being again enclosed herewith this letter as Annex-B , so you are requested to please give us full(10) marks against the said point) iii) We have</td><td>Mr. -Usman Asghar from M/s Frontier Dextrose Limited attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. GRC decided that

For item no 36 refer to decision of Unisa pharmaceutical industries LTD at serial no. 27

For item no 25 refer to decision of Sanofi-Aventis Pakistan limited at serial no. 2

Firm online data submission was verified from PQOD portal for item no. 8 (Stericipro 100ml) hence grievance of the firm accepted to the extent of this parameter. However, firm did not provided undertaking regarding specification of item no. 8 (Stericipro 100ml) as per advertised specification of bidding documents.

Firm did not submit Lay out plan/ diagram of wastewater treatment plant as per requirement of advertised marking criteria of bidding hence grievance of the firm was rejected for this parameter.

Firm submitted valid undertaking for provision of stock in refer container which was accepted hence grievance of the firm was accepted to the extent of this parameter and 3 marks granted for this category.</td></tr>
</table>

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				received 0 marks against Waste Water Treatment Plant. Please note that we have attached documents regarding said point along with SOP's and Layout Plan at page no's 368-370. (Copy of the same is being again enclosed herewith this letter as Annex-C , so you are requested to please give us full(03) marks against this point) iv) We have received 0 marks against Logistic System point. Please note that we have dedicated Reefer Container (maintaining controlled temperature as per the items Specs) (Copy of the same is being again enclosed herewith this letter as Annex-D , so you are requested to please give us full(03) marks against this point) v) We have received 0 marks against Primary Reference Standards point. Please note that we have attached documents regarding Primary Reference Standards at page no's 445-450 and the same is being enclosed herewith this letter as Annex-E for your reference so you are requested to please give us full (2) marks. v) According to point no 10 of RFP i.e Technical Staff of Manufacturer we have attached detailed list of our employees including 10 pharmacists but unfortunately we have received 0 marks. (Copy of the same is being again enclosed herewith this letter as Annex-F , so you are requested to please give us full(05) marks against this point) Keeping in view of above mentioned justifications you are requested to please reevaluate your Technical Evaluation report for a healthy competition and for the benefits of patients and for all stakeholders. Assuring you of our best co-operation at all times.	Firm submitted private sector sale data for item no. 8 (Stericipro 100ml), was not verified hence grievance of the firm was rejected to the extent of this parameter. Firm submitted degree, salary slips and employment letters for 10 employed pharmacists were accepted hence 5 marks granted for this category to item no. 8 (Stericipro 100ml), However, with addition of these marks for item no. 8 (Stericipro 100ml) status remained unchanged and **Non Responsive.**
16	Cirin Pharmaceuticals (Pvt) Limited		Non Compliance of item wise knock down clause no. 1 and 2 (IN. 21,22,29,30)	Refer to DGHS Drug/Medicine Pre-Qualification FY 2019-20 evaluation report. Respected Sir, we M/S CIRIN Pharmaceutical is 100% owned by ICI Pakistan Limited from Jan 2017. Since we become a part of ICI Pak LTD our all administrative controls and procedure governed by ICI. For your satisfaction we also attached the copy of relevant documents. Sir, we are already prequalified from different institution like MCC KPK, DGDP/CPMC, PESSI and last year also from your esteem department almost on the same criteria. As per your evaluation report we are not Pre-qualified because of Knockdown Clause firm wise 5 & 6 which are	Mr. Munim khan from M/s Cirin Pharmaceuticals (Pvt) Limited attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. GRC decided that Firms submitted data for Private sector sale was not verified hence grievance of the firm was rejected for this parameter Firm submitted Standard Operating Procedure and Layout diagram of wastewater plant is acceptable hence 3 marks granted for this category

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				ISO 14001 & ISO 18001 or its relevant SOP's required & item wise Clause 1 & 2. So Sir, against knockdown criteria 5 and 6 we submitted our SOP's for HSE&S. We also submitted undertaking in that where we clearly mentioned that Cirin company is 100% owned by ICI Pakistan and we follow all the SOP's very strictly its governed by ICI for ready reference copies attached. As per clause 1 & 2 we already submitted valid DRC's for our quoted items & valid GMP certificate which shows section wise details for our production site. And which is the surety that the quoted items are manufactured in our GMP accreted factory. Kindly it is requested that please review your decision and accept our HSE&S SOP's under Clause 5 & 6 & DRC/GMP under clause 1 & 2. For evidence purposes we also submitting additional supporting documents which confirms that we are following HSE&S SOP's strictly. So Sir, kindly accept our grievance and restore our status as prequalified/ complied.	Firm submitted SOP instead of ISO 14001 certification is noncompliance of advertised bid evaluation marking criteria which is not acceptable hence grievance of the firm was rejected in regard. Firm for claim of its public sale only summery provided with grievance application however provision of Purchase orders is mandatory as per advertised criteria of bidding documents hence grievance of firm is rejected for this parameter. Firms provided private sales data (601272 units) for its quoted item Hy-cortisone Injection 250mg which falls in category of above 25% hence grievance of the firm accepted in this regard and 3 Marks added for this item after this addition the total marks for Hy-cortisone become 42 and firm status for this item become **Responsive.** However, firms provided sales data for Corinef Suspension 100 mg (93,865 units) and Cefcin Injection 1 gm (297599 units) which are lower than 25% of advertised quantity hence 0 marks granted for this parameter and status of thse quoted item of firm remained unchanged and **Non Responsiv**e.
17	Scilife Pharma (Pvt.) Ltd.	Montelukast 10mg, Diclofenac Sodium 50mg and Omeprazole 20mg	Non-Responsive	We would like to record our grievance on the decision of authority to mark Scilife Pharma Pvt. Ltd. As technically Non-Responsive firm on the basis of following points Compulsory Parameters 1. Authority marked our 3 quoted items Montelukast 10mg, Diclofenac Sodium 50mg and Omeprazole 20mg as not prequalified a. With reference to Sr. # 92 on page # 70 of MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL COMMITTEE HELD ON SEPTEMBER 18, 2019 AT 10.30 A.M TO REDRESS THE GRIEVANCES OF THE AGAINST PREQUALIFICATION EVALUATION REPORT OF PHARMACEUTICAL MANUFACTURERS& SOLE AGENTS OF FOREIGN PRINCIPLES FOR PURCHASE OF DRUGS/MEDICINES & MEDICAL DEVICES FOR FY 2019-2020, FOR DIRECTORATE GENERAL HEALTH SERVICES, PUNJAB, our firm's grievance has been accepted and marked as pre-qualified. Minutes of meeting of the grievance is attached. b. Refer to the notification of Pre-Qualification of Drugs/Medicines &	Mr. Faisal Idrees from M/s Scilife Pharma (Pvt.) Ltd. attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that Firm declared prequalified in GRC decision and DRC provided by the firm was accepted. ISO 17025 & ISO 14001 was not provided by the firm and SOP of both certificates was not the requirement as per RFP evaluation criteria so no mark will be given. Waste water treatment not as per standards, under taking of refer container is accepted where (3) marks are awarded now., undertaking of sub-standard drug provided so (10) marks are awarded. Functional stability chamber is 3 in number so (3) marks are given. Reference standard required data is not provided. However, source of API (Diclofenac 50 mg tablets-Panslay brand) marks awarded in TER are 5 but firm GD copies of FDA approved API manufacturer M/s Amoli Organic, so (5) more marks awarded now api total marks are (10). Private sales of quoted brand Panslay 50mg is less than 25 % the advertised quantity. No public sector sales record provided. Accelerated stability study

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				Medical Devices 2019-20, document reference # 8276-90 dated 03-10-2019, page # 10, 28, 32, 47, 52 and 57 authority has declared our products as Pre-Qualified. Prequalification report attached from page # 12 to 18 however again PQ Notification attached with this letter. 2. DRCs not attached a. We attached DRCs of our quoted items along with bidding documents from Page # 24 to 31 of bidding documents however we are submitting again with this letter. Ordinary Parameters 1. Source of API of Quoted Items a. Company provided complete GD of its APIs with certificate of analysis from page # 39 to 90. However we are again submitting with this letter 2. Supply of the quoted products in Private Sector a. All relevant documents along with stamp paper attached with bidding documents from page # 94 to 284. However we are again submitting with this letter 3. Supply of the quoted product in Public Sector a. All relevant documents along with stamp paper attached with bidding documents from page # 285 to 307. However we are again submitting with this letter. 4. Credibility & Certification of Manufacturer a. ISO 17025 i. We already have established SOPs which were submitted in pre-qualification process and firm declared prequalified and also attached with bidding documents from page # 308 to 338. After the prequalification we initiated process to get ISO. Respected authority already knows and considers that to get this certification through legal process needs time. SOPs are attached with this letter b. ISO 14001 i. We already have established SOPs which were submitted in pre-qualification process and firm declared prequalified. After the prequalification we initiated process to get ISO 14001 and signed contract with a firm. Contract documents and SOPs were attached with bidding documents from page # 343 to 369. However contract agreement and SOPs are attached with this letter. c. Waste Water Treatment Plant i. We attached all relevant documents along with Lay out plan with bidding	data provided and (1) mark is given but real time stability data is incomplete so no mark is awarded. Now total marks for item panslay 50 mg tab have become 35 instead of 13. GRC upheld the decision of TEC and status of the firm is still remained as **"Non-Responsive"** Source of API (Montelukast 10 mg tablets-Asthiven brand) marks awarded in TER are 5 but firm GD copies of FDA approved API manufacturer M/s Enaltec labs pvt Ltd where address of API manufacturing plant is different on FDA website as compared to claimed API source by the firm, so no additional marks will be given. Private sales was re-checked and found more than 100 % of the tendered quantity so (10) marks are awarded.No mark will be given in public sector sales. Accelerated stability study data provided and (1) mark is given but real time stability data is incomplete so no mark is awarded. Now total marks for item Asthiven 10 mg tab have become 40 instead of 13. GRC upheld the decision of TEC and status of the firm is still remained as **"Non-Responsive"** Source of API (omeprazol 20 mg capsule-Lomisec brand) marks awarded in TER are 5 as not FDA approved source. No additional marks can be given.Sales pf quoted brand Lomisec 20mg cap is less than even 25 % of the tendered quantity and firm claimed Lomisec cap 40mg sales (that is not quoted brand) mixed with Lomisec 20mg cap, so no mark will be given as per criteria. Public sector sales record (P.O & invoices attached) that is above 25% of the required tendered quantity so (3) marks are awarded. Accelerated stability study data provided and (1) mark is given but real time stability data is incomplete so no mark is awarded. DRC provided that was accepted. Now total marks for item Lomisec 20mg cap a have become 33 instead of 13. GRC upheld the decision of TEC and status of the firm is still remained as **"Non-Responsive".**

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				documents from page # 370 to 375. 5. Quality of Product a. Undertaking submitted that our NO product has been declared substandard by DTL in last financial year from page # 376 to 378. We are again submitting undertaking with this letter. 6. Number of Functional Stability Chamber a. Firm attached undertaking that we have 3 functional stability chamber from page # 379 to 387. We are again submitting undertaking with this letter. 7. Stability Studies a. Firm has already submitted both Accelerated Stability study data and Real Time Stability Study Data from page # 393 to 432. However we are again submitting with this letter. 8. Primary Reference Standard with Valid Shelf Life used for Quality Control Testing/Analysis of Quoted Item a. All relevant documents have been submitted along with bidding documents from page # 433 to 447. However we are again submitting with this letter. With reference to mentioned reasons we are again providing all documents in order to serve as justification and support our grievance on the decision of the committee. Therefore please consider our documents and re-evaluate Scilife Pharma Pvt. Ltd. marking and Non-Responsive status.	
18	GlaxoSmithKline Pakistan Limited	., Susp. Amoxicillin 250mg + Clavulanic Acid 62.5 mg per 5 ml.(Maxil 500mg cap and Maxil fort	Responsive (Grievance against M/s Macter)	GRIEVANCE AGAINST MACTER INTERNATIONAL FOR SUSP. AMOXICILLIN 250MG + CLAVULANIC ACID 62.5MG PER 5ML We GSK Pakistan (Pvt.) limited have a faith on the Government of the Punjab procurement drive for provision of quality medicines. We participated in the process of procurement and received the Evaluation Report. We have some reservations regarding the qualification of Macter International for item at serial # 12 i.e., Susp. Amoxicillin 250mg + Clavulanic Acid 62.5 mg per 5 ml. The quantity demanded for the item was 1,000,000 suspensions. Total marks were 70 and qualifying marks were 42. Macter International has attained 42 marks and announced qualified. GSK Pakistan is of the view that marks allocated to Macter International are higher than to be allocated originally. The explanation is given below: Against criteria # 3 of ordinary parameters “Supply of the quoted product at least 25% to below 50% of advertised quantity in Public Sector” the firm has been awarded 3	Mr. Noman Khan from M/s GlaxoSmithKline Pakistan Limited. attended the meeting and presented their grievance against M/s Macter International Pvt Ltd to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm M/s GSK and also heard the representative of the firm M/s Macter Intl Pvt Ltd Mr.Mumtaz Zaidi which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that firm M/s Macter Intl Pvt Ltd has provided undertaking as per given criteria on Rs:100 stamp paper and grievance of M/s GSK is not accepted extent to this point of supply of goods via refer container. However As per Grienace of M/s GSK public sector sales of M/s macter quoted items pointed out by M/s GSK was re-checked (The quoted item of M/s Macter was 60 ml susp instead of 90ml) and found that sales of item Co-Amoxi Ds 60 ml suspension is less than 25 % tendered quantity so no

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
		suspension 90 ml)		Marks which means that the firm had sold at least 250,000 bottles of 90 ml of the quoted item in public sector. The bidder shall provide (attach) summary of purchase orders of institutional sale. (This summary must be on stamp paper of Rs.100 duly legalized/notarized along with Purchase Orders. The Purchase Orders may be verified, and any false claim shall lead to disqualification/blacklisting of firm). We GSK Pakistan is of the view that the Macter has never sold 250,000 bottles of 90 ml of item no.12 in public sector as demanded in criteria. Hence, the 3 marks already allocated to firm be deducted. Cont'd page 2,,,, GRIEVANCE AGAINST MACTER INTERNATIONAL FOR Page: 2. SUSP. AMOXICILLIN 250MG + CLAVULANIC ACID 62.5MG PER 5ML As per criteria # 7 (Logistic System) of ordinary parameters "the firm has dedicated refer container for delivery of goods to procuring agency. The firm will undertake on notarized judicial stamp paper of Rs.100 that they have dedicated Reefer Container (maintaining controlled temperature as per item specs) and they will supply stock in the same container. Physical assurance will be pre-requisite at the time of delivery of goods" the firm has been awarded 3 Marks which means the firm has dedicated reefer container system. We GSK Pakistan is of the view that Macter does not have dedicated Reefer Container System and never opted for supply of item as demanded in criteria. The same may be verified from seeking containers details of previous supplies to DGHS Punjab. It is specified that marks can only been awarded on available facility/ history rather than provision of facility to be promised by bidder. Hence, the 3 marks already allocated to firm be deducted. Thanking & assuring you our best services at all times. Yours faithfully. GlaxoSmithKline Pakistan Limited Muhammad Khalid Qureshi Head of Tender & Key Accounts December 23, 2019. Director General Health Services Punjab 24-Cooper Road, Lahore. Subject: GRIEVANCE AGAINST MACTER INTERNATIONAL FOR SUSP. AMOXICILLIN 250MG per 5ML We GSK Pakistan (Pvt.) limited have a faith on the Government of the Punjab procurement drive for provision of quality medicines. We participated in the process of procurement and received the Evaluation	marks will be awarded in Public sector sales and already awarded (3) marks are deducted and now firm's total marks of Co-Amoxi DS 60 ml susp are 39 out of 70. Grievance of the Firm M/s GSK is hereby accepted. Meanwhile Representative of the firm M/s Macter requested that (3) marks are not given in this item in market sales and requested to recheck the private sales. Private sector sales was re-checked and found that sales of item Co-Amoxi Ds 60 ml suspension is more than 25 % of tendered quantity.so (3) marks are awarded in Private sector sales. Now firm's total marks of Co-Amoxi DS 60 ml susp have become 42 out of 70. GRC upheld the decision of TEC and status of the firm is still remained as **"Responsive"** Public sector sales of quoted items by M/s Macter (Maxil 500mg cap and Maxil fort suspension 90 ml) re-checked and is verified so grievance of M/s GSK is rejected and status of the items (Maxil 500mg cap and Maxil fort suspension 90 ml) will be remained same and GRC upheld the decision of TEC and status of both items will be remained same as **"Responsive"**

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				Report. We have some reservations regarding the qualification of Macter International for item at serial # 18 i.e., Susp. Amoxicillin 250mg per 5 ml. The quantity demanded for the item was 6,000,000 suspensions. Total marks were 70 and qualifying marks were 42. Macter International has attained 42 marks and announced qualified. GSK Pakistan is of the view that marks allocated to Macter International are higher than to be allocated originally. The explanation is given below: Against criteria # 3 of ordinary parameters "Supply of the quoted product at least 25% to below 50% of advertised quantity in Public Sector" the firm has been awarded 3 Marks which means that the firm had sold at least 1,500,000 bottles of 90 ml of the quoted item in public sector. The bidder shall provide (attach) summary of purchase orders of institutional sale. (This summary must be on stamp paper of Rs.100 duly legalized/notarized along with Purchase Orders. The Purchase Orders may be verified, and any false claim shall lead to disqualification/blacklisting of firm). We GSK Pakistan is of the view that the Macter has never sold 1,500,000 bottles of 90 ml of item no.18 in public sector as demanded in criteria. Hence, the 3 marks already allocated to firm be deducted. Cont'd page 2,,,, GRIEVANCE AGAINST MACTER INTERNATIONAL FOR Page: 2. SUSP. AMOXICILLIN 250MG PER 5ML As per criteria # 7 (Logistic System) of ordinary parameters "the firm has dedicated refer container for delivery of goods to procuring agency. The firm will undertake on notarized judicial stamp paper of Rs.100 that they have dedicated Reefer Container (maintaining controlled temperature as per item specs) and they will supply stock in the same container. Physical assurance will be pre-requisite at the time of delivery of goods" the firm has been awarded 3 Marks which means the firm has dedicated reefer container system. We GSK Pakistan is of the view that Macter does not have dedicated Reefer Container System and never opted for supply of item as demanded in criteria. The same may be verified from seeking containers details of previous supplies to DGHS Punjab. It is specified that marks can only been awarded on available facility/ history rather than provision of facility to be promised by bidder. Hence, the 3 marks already	

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				allocated to firm be deducted. Thanking & assuring you our best services at all times. Yours faithfully. GlaxoSmithKline Pakistan Limited Muhammad Khalid Qureshi Head of Tender & Key Accounts December 23, 2019. Director General Health Services Punjab 24-Cooper Road Lahore Subject: GRIEVANCE AGAINST MACTER INTERNATIONAL FOR CAP. AMOXICILLIN 500MG. We GSK Pakistan (Pvt.) limited have a faith on the Government of the Punjab procurement drive for provision of quality medicines. We participated in the process of procurement and received the Evaluation Report. We have some reservations regarding the qualification of Macter International for item at serial # 17 i.e., Cap. Amoxicillin 500mg. The quantity demanded for the item was 600,000 packs. Total marks were 70 and qualifying marks were 42. Macter International has attained 42 marks and announced qualified. GSK Pakistan is of the view that marks allocated to Macter International are higher than to be allocated originally. The explanation is given below: Against criteria # 3 of ordinary parameters "Supply of the quoted product at least 25% to below 50% of advertised quantity in Public Sector" the firm has been awarded 3 Marks which means that the firm had sold at least 150,000 packs of 100's of the quoted item in public sector. The bidder shall provide (attach) summary of purchase orders of institutional sale. (This summary must be on stamp paper of Rs.100 duly legalized/notarized along with Purchase Orders. The Purchase Orders may be verified, and any false claim shall lead to disqualification/blacklisting of firm). We GSK Pakistan is of the view that the Macter has never sold 150,000 packs of 100's of item no.17 in public sector as demanded in criteria. Hence, the 3 marks already allocated to firm be deducted. Cont'd page 2,,,, GRIEVANCE AGAINST MACTER INTERNATIONAL FOR Page: 2. CAP. AMOXICILLIN 500MG PER PACK OF 100's. As per criteria # 7 (Logistic System) of ordinary parameters "the firm has dedicated refer container for delivery of goods to procuring agency. The firm will undertake on notarized judicial stamp paper of Rs.100 that they have dedicated Reefer Container (maintaining controlled temperature as per item specs) and they will supply stock in the same container. Physical	

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				assurance will be pre-requisite at the time of delivery of goods" the firm has been awarded 3 Marks which means the firm has dedicated reefer container system. We GSK Pakistan is of the view that Macter does not have dedicated Reefer Container System and never opted for supply of item as demanded in criteria. The same may be verified from seeking containers details of previous supplies to DGHS Punjab. It is specified that marks can only been awarded on available facility/ history rather than provision of facility to be promised by bidder. Hence, the 3 marks already allocated to firm be deducted. Thanking & assuring you our best services at all times. Yours faithfully. GlaxoSmithKline Pakistan Limited Muhammad Khalid Qureshi Head of Tender & Key Accounts	
19	Surge Laboratories Private Limited.	. 04 (nj. Diclofenac Sodium 75mg/3 ml ITEM NO. 14 (Inj. Ceftriaxone (as sodium) I.V 1g. lignocaine 2% 10ml injection. Gentamycin 80 mg	Non-Responsive	REQUEST FOR REVALIDATION / REDRESSAL OF GRIEVANCE (ITEM NO, 4,14,43 AND 49) TENDER OPENED ON 13.11.2019 Please refer to the subject cited above. It is intimated for your kind information that we have participated in the subject Tender and offered our products. It has come to our notice through Technical Evaluation report displayed on DGHS Punjab website on 16.12.2019 that our under mentioned items are not qualified in this tender due to less grading / short Numbering. Details are as under:- ITEM NO. 04 (nj. Diclofenac Sodium 75mg/3ml. Ampoule of 3ml,pack of 10's or less,) S.NO TECHNICAL CRITERIA TOTAL MARKS MARKES OBTAINED REMARKS 2 EXPERIENCE OF THE QUOTED PRODUCT SINCE JAN 2018 TO OCT 2019 (In Private Sector) 10 0 Our sale of this product is more than 100% of the advertised quantity in private sector. Sale Summary attached (Please Revalidate) 4. CREDIBILITY AND CERTIFICATION OF MANUFACTURER Valid ISO 14001 (Environment Management System (EMS) certificate) 3 0 Valid ISO 14001 attached. (Please Revalidate) 6. Number of Stability Chambers 6 0 We are having Three Functional Stability Chambers (Please revalidate) 9. Primary Reference Standard used for Quality Control Testing / Analysis of quality item 2 0 Import / Shipping Documents and Certificate of analysis are attached (Please Revalidate) ITEM NO. 14 (Inj. Ceftriaxone (as sodium) I.V 1g. Glass vial, individually packed in carton with solvent	Mr.ASim Mirza from M/s Surge Laboratories Private Limited attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that firm provided ISO 14001 certificate that is valid and accepted and (3) marks are awarded to the firm, however functional stability chambers are 3 in number so (3) mark are being awarded as per evaluation criteria as relevant document is provided by the firm, Reference standard required data is not provided. 1. Private sector sales of quoted item (diclofenac sod. 75 mg inj with brand name Lisodim 75 mg injection) was re-checked and found more than 25 % of the tendered quantity so (3) marks are awarded, now total marks have become 34 instead of 25 but the status of the item is unchanged and GRC upheld the decision of TEC and status of items will be remained same as **"Non-Responsive"** 2. Private sector sales of quoted item (ceftriaxone 1gm injection with brand name Sergifex 1 gm IV injection with solvent) was re-checked and found more than 25 % of the tendered quantity so (3) marks are awarded, now total marks have become 42 instead of 33 and the status of the item is changed from non-responsive to responsive and GRC accepted the grievance of firm extent to said item and status of items is changed from non-responsive to "**Responsive"**

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
		injectio n		and leaflet) S.NO TECHNICAL CRITERIA TOTAL MARKS MARKES OBTAINED REMARKS 2 EXPERIENCE OF THE QUOTED PRODUCT SINCE JAN 2018 TO OCT 2019 (In Private Sector) 10 0 Our sale of this product is more than 100% of the advertised quantity in private sector. Sale Summary attached (Please Revalidate) 4. CREDIBILITY AND CERTIFICATION OF MANUFACTURER Valid ISO 14001 (Environment Management System (EMS) certificate) 3 0 Valid ISO 14001 attached. (Please Revalidate) 6. Number of Stability Chambers 6 0 We are having Three Functional Stability Chambers (Please revalidate) 9. Primary Reference Standard used for Quality Control Testing / Analysis of quality item 2 0 Import / Shipping Documents and Certificate of analysis are attached (Please Revalidate) ITEM NO. 43 (nj. Lignocaine 2% 10ml ampoule. Pack of 100 or less, packed in carton with leaflet) S.NO TECHNICAL CRITERIA TOTAL MARKS MARKES OBTAINED REMARKS 2 EXPERIENCE OF THE QUOTED PRODUCT SINCE JAN 2018 TO OCT 2019 (In Private Sector) 10 0 Our sale of this product is more than 50% of the advertised quantity in private sector. Sale Summary attached (Please Revalidate) 4. CREDIBILITY AND CERTIFICATION OF MANUFACTURER Valid ISO 14001 (Environment Management System (EMS) certificate) 3 0 Valid ISO 14001 attached. (Please Revalidate) 6. Number of Stability Chambers 6 0 We are having Three Functional Stability Chambers (Please revalidate) 9. Primary Reference Standard used for Quality Control Testing / Analysis of quality item 2 0 Import / Shipping Documents and Certificate of analysis are attached (Please Revalidate) ITEM NO. 49 (Inj Gentamycin 80mg. Pack of 5 or less packed in carton with leaflet) S.NO TECHNICAL CRITERIA TOTAL MARKS MARKES OBTAINED REMARKS 2 EXPERIENCE OF THE QUOTED PRODUCT SINCE JAN 2018 TO OCT 2019 (In Private Sector) 10 0 Our sale of this product is more than 70% of the advertised quantity in private sector. Sale Summary attached (Please Revalidate) EXPERIENCE OF THE QUOTED PRODUCT SINCE JAN 2018 TO OCT 2019 (In Public Sector) 10 0 Our sale of this product is more than 100% of the advertised quantity in public sector. Orders attached (Please Revalidate) 4. CREDIBILITY AND CERTIFICATION OF MANUFACTURER	3. Private sector sales of quoted item (lignocaine 2% 10ml injection with brand name lidoject) was re-checked and not verified, Firm provided data of reference standards so (2) marks are given ,now total marks have become 43 instead of 35 the status of the item is changed from non-responsive to responsive and GRC accepted the grievance of firm extent to said item and status of items is changed from non-responsive to "**Responsive".** 4. Private sector sales of quoted item (Gentamycin 80 mg injection with brand name GENXAT) was re-checked and not verified so no mark will be given. Public sector sales re-checked that was more than 100 %of advertised quantity so (10) marks are awarded. Firm provided data of reference standards so (2) marks are given, become 43 instead of 25 the status of the item is changed from non-responsive to responsive and GRC accepted the grievance of firm extent to said item and status of items is changed from non-responsive to "**Responsive".**

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				Valid ISO 14001 (Environment Management System (EMS) certificate) 3 0 Valid ISO 14001 attached. (Please Revalidate) 6. Number of Stability Chambers 6 0 We are having Three Functional Stability Chambers (Please revalidate) 9. Primary Reference Standard used for Quality Control Testing / Analysis of quality item 2 0 Import / Shipping Documents and Certificate of analysis are attached (Please Revalidate) In the light of above mentioned provided documents. It is requested to please give additional marks in our above mentioned items of said technical offer for healthy competition and in the best interest of needy peoples. Your cooperation in this regard will be much appreciated. We assure you our best cooperation.	
20	AsianContinental (Pvt.) Ltd.	Metformin (hydrochloride) Tablets 500mg (Meteor 500mg Tab.) Tranexamic Acid Caps 500mg (Traxacid 500mg Caps) Tranexamic Acid Inj 500mg/5ml	Non-Responsive	Sir, Our following three products have been declared non responsive as we have not been awarded points in the following criteria of ordinary parameters:- FOR ALL PRODUCTS:- 1) Waste water treatment plant:- We have provided the official SOP and layout plan of the waste water treatment plant therefore kindly award us full marks. 2) Primary Reference Standard:- We have attached all the relevant documents along with reference standard. Kindly award us full marks in this criteria. Tender Inquiry # 22: Metformin (hydrochloride) Tablets 500mg (Meteor 500mg Tab.) 1) API Source:- We have been awarded 5 marks. We have attached the valid GMP certificate of the manufacturer issued by the Food & Drugs Control Administration (FDA) which clearly states that the certificate is as per "WHO TRS No. 908 of 2003". We are attaching it again. The certificate also mentions that the product metformin is for "Grant of COPP as per WHO Guidelines". Therefore kindly award us full 10 marks for this section. 2) Supply in private sector:- We have been awarded 0 marks even though we have provided the sales summary (To distributors) from January 2018 till November 2019. The IMS data is attached which further proves that our sales meet more than 50% of the required quantity. For verification of our sales summary we can provide the copies of all invoices in hard copies / CD if required by the department. Kindly award us at least 5 marks in this. We are also attaching distributors summary	Mr. M.Taimoor Abbas from M/s Asian Continental (Pvt.) Ltd. attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that firm provided SOP and Layout plan is not as per standards so no mark will be awarded. Primary reference standards data was not verified so no mark will be awarded. 1.API source of quoted item Metformin (hydrochloride) Tablets 500mg (Meteor 500mg Tab.) was re-checked copies are provided by the firm and API manufacturer Aarti Drugs Limited India is not US FDA approved so no extra mark will be given. Private sale data was re-checked that was more than 50 %of advertised quantity so (5) marks are awarded. total marks are 43 and the status of the item is changed from non-responsive to responsive and GRC accepted the grievance of firm extent to said item and status of items is changed from non-responsive to "**Responsive"** 2.API source of quoted item Tranexamic Acid Caps 500mg (Traxacid 500mg Caps) was re-checked as Hunan Dongting Pharma co, Ltd is US FDA approved so (5) extra mark will be given. Private sale data provided by the firm and was rechecked that was more than 100 %of advertised quantity so (10) marks are awarded. Now total marks are 56 instead of 41 the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to" **Responsive".**

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
		(Traxacid 500mg/ 5ml Inj).		for further verification. Tender Inquiry # 51: Tranexamic Acid Caps 500mg (Traxacid 500mg Caps) 1) API Source:- We have been awarded 5 marks. We have attached the valid GMP certificate of the manufacturer issued by the Food & Drugs Control Administration (FDA) which is valid till 31/02/2021 therefore kindly award us full marks. We have also attached the letter by department of Health & human services which states that the API is acceptable for U.S. Food and Drug Administration. (FDA) 2) Supply in private sector:- We have been awarded 0 marks even though we have provided the sales summary (to distributors) from January 2018 till October 2019. The IMS data is attached which further proves that our sales meet more than 100% of the required quantity. For verification of our sales summary we can provide the copies of all invoices in hard copies / CD if required by the department. Kindly award us full marks in this section. We are also attaching distributors sales summary for further verification. Tender Inquiry # 50 Tranexamic Acid Inj 500mg/5ml (Traxacid 500mg/5ml Inj). 1) API Source:- We have been awarded 5 marks. We have attached the valid GMP certificate of the manufacturer issued by the Food & Drugs Control Administration (FDA) which is valid till 31/02/2021 therefore kindly award us full marks. We have also attached the letter by department of Health & human services which states that the API is acceptable for U.S. Food and Drug Administration. (FDA) 2) Supply in private sector:- We have been awarded 0 marks even though we have provided the sales summary from January 2018 till October 2019. For verification of our sales summary we can provide the copies of all invoices in hard copies / CD if required by the department. Kindly award us at least 5 marks in this.	3.API source of quoted item Tranexamic Acid Inj 500mg/5ml (Traxacid 500mg/5ml Inj).) was re-checked as Hunan Dongting Pharma co, Ltd is US FDA approved so (5) extra mark will be given. Private sale data provided by the firm and was rechecked that was more than 25 % of advertised quantity so (3) marks are awarded Now total marks are 39 instead of 31 but the status of the item is unchanged and still same as "**Non-Responsive".**
21	Indus Pharma Pvt Ltd	Oxytocin Injection (Syntomax) Cefixim	Non-Responsive	The Chairman Grievance Committee Dated: 24.12.2019 Directorate General Health Services Punjab 24-Cooper Road Lahore. Sub: GRIEVANCE AGAINST NON-RESPONSIVE RESULT OF OUR QUOTED ITEMS Respected Sir Please refer to your published bid evaluation report in which our quoted items are declared non responsive due to obtained marks are less than minimum qualifying marks. In this regard, our humble submissions are as	Mr. M.Faisal from M/s Indus Pharma Pvt Ltd. attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that firm provided GMP certificate that is accepted by the GRC. Waste water treatment plant SOP Layout plan

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
		e Suspension 100mg/5ml (Maxpan)		under for your kind consideration: SR # 105 (T.E # 28) Oxytocin Injection (Syntomax) Marks obtained: 37 (a) VALID GMP CERTIFICATE: It is requested that at the time of Pre-Qualification our GMP Certificate was valid and as result we were declared as PRE-QUALIFIED BIDDER but at the time of submission of bid on 11.11.2019 our GMP Certificate was expired and fresh GMP Certificate was under-process at the level of Drug Regulatory Authority of Pakistan (DRAP). So we attached the old GMP Certificate with application and fee paid challan for issuance of fresh GMP Certificate in bid. Now on 29.11.2019 the DRAP has issued us the valid GMP Certificate. We are enclosing following documents: • Valid GMP Certificate • Old GMP Certificate • Application for new GMP • Fee paid challan for new GMP (b) SALE IN PRIVATE SECTOR: Please note that our Sale in Private Sector i.e. 11 Million Amps. (approx) is higher than advertised quantity i.e. 3 Million Amps. (Kindly award 10 Marks). We are enclosing following documents: • IMS Data on IMS's letter head (215,798 x 50 = 10,789,900 Amps.) • Undertaking on Stamp Paper (already submitted in our bid). • Sales Summary (already submitted in our bid). (c) WASTE WATER TREATMENT PLANT: Please note that we have installed Waste Water Treatment Plant in our manufacturing unit. (Kindly award 3 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Layout Plan • SOPs. (d) ACCELERATED STABILITY STUDY REPORT We are enclosing the Accelerated Stability Study Report. (Kindly award 1 Mark) (e) PRIMARY REFERENCE STANDARDS: We have the primary reference standard. (Kindly award 2 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Certificate of Analysis. • Leaflet • Picture So the Total Marks will be :53 (37+10+3+1+2) SR # 106 (T.E # 58) Cefixime Suspension 100mg/5ml (Maxpan) Marks obtained: 37 (f) VALID GMP CERTIFICATE: It is requested that at the time of Pre-Qualification our GMP Certificate was valid and as result we were declared as PRE-QUALIFIED BIDDER but at the time of submission of bid on 11.11.2019 our GMP Certificate was expired and fresh GMP Certificate was under-process at the level of Drug Regulatory Authority of Pakistan (DRAP). So we attached the old GMP Certificate with application and fee paid	is not as per standards so no mark will be awarded. Primary reference standards data was not verified so no mark will be awarded. Private sector sales data of Oxytocin Injection (Syntomax) was re-checked and found that private sector sales is above the 100% of the total advertised quantity so (10) marks are being awarded. Now total marks are 47 instead of 37 the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to" **Responsive".** Status of Cefixime Suspension 100mg/5ml (Maxpan) will be remained same with 37 marks and grievance of firm is rejected for said item and the status of the item is unchanged and still same as "**Non-Responsive".**

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				challan for issuance of fresh GMP Certificate in bid. Now on 29.11.2019 the DRAP has issued us the valid GMP Certificate. We are enclosing following documents: • Valid GMP Certificate • Old GMP Certificate • Application for new GMP • Fee paid challan for new GMP (g) WASTE WATER TREATMENT PLANT: Please note that we have installed Waste Water Treatment Plant in our manufacturing unit. (Kindly award 3 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Layout Plan • SOPs. (h) ACCELERATED STABILITY STUDY REPORT We are enclosing the Accelerated Stability Study Report. (Kindly award 1 Mark) (i) PRIMARY REFERENCE STANDARDS: We have the primary reference standard. (Kindly award 2 Marks) We are enclosing the following documents: • Certificate of Analysis. • Leaflet • Picture So the Total Marks will be :43 (37+3+1+2) So, in view of above mentioned facts, it is requested that above mentioned additional marks may please be added in our current marks and declare us as Responsive Bidder. Thanking you. Yours truly, for Indus Pharma (Pvt) Ltd. Zubair Hashmi (Institutional Sales Manager) Copy to: Director General Health Services Punjab, Lahore.	
22	NovaMed Pharmaceuticals (Pvt.) Limited	OMEPRAZOLE CAPSULE 20MG	Non-Responsive	The Chairman Grievance Committee Dated: 23.12.2019 Directorate General Health Services Punjab 24-Cooper Road Lahore. Sub: GRIEVANCE TO RE-CONSIDER TECHNICAL MARKS OF OMEPRAZOLE CAPSULE 20MG (OZOLE), PACK OF 14'S (S.NO. 142, P.Q. NO. 250& T.E. NO. 27).__ Respected Sir Please refer to your Evaluation Report of our Technical Bid in which our subject mentioned quoted item declared non-responsive as 5 marks of 10 Pharmacists were not awarded as result 41 marks granted (1 mark less than qualifying marks i.e. 42). In this regard, our humble submissions are as under for your kind consideration: ¬ We have 33 technical staff at our plant which complete list (with name, designation, qualification and experience) attached online and also hard copy in our bid. ¬ We have attached the 10 technical staff's degrees, appointment letters and salary slips online (which fulfilled requirement of 10 technical staff). ¬ We have attached the 33 technical staff's degrees,	Mr.M.Faisal from M/s NovaMed Pharmaceuticals (Pvt.) Limited attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that firm provided the documents of 10 pharmacist as technical staff's degrees, appointment letters and salary slips which was accepted by GRC and (5) marks are being awarded to the firm. Now Quoted Brand ozol 20mg cap marks have 46 marks instead of 41 and status of the item is changed from non-responsive to **Responsive.**

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				appointment letters and salary slips in hard copy of bid. ¬ The honorable pre-qualification team of Primary & Secondary Health Care Department is also witness that our technical staffs are more than 30 during their last visit. ¬ We offer honorable committee to visit our plant at 28-Km Ferozpur Road, Lahore to check our claim of 33 technical staff. So, in view of above mentioned facts, we request you to kindly accept our grievance and declared our O Zole Cap. 20mg (Omerprazole) as Responsive for healthy competition. Thanking you. Yours truly, for Novamed Pharmaceuticals (Pvt) Ltd. Arslan Afza lFarooqui (Asst.Manager Institution) C.c. to: Director General Health Services Punjab, Lahore.	
23	Nabiqasim Industries (Private) Limited	ITEM NO. 29 (Expectorant Syp/Susp Tab. Atenolol 50mg, Syp. Chlorpheniramine maleate 2mg / 5ml Suspension Cefixime	Non-Responsive	REQUEST FOR REVALIDATION / REDRESSAL OF GRIEVANCE (ITEM NO, 29,33,46 AND 58) TENDER OPENED ON 13.11.2019 Please refer to the subject cited above. It is intimated for your kind information that we have participated in the subject Tender and offered our products. It has come to our notice through Technical Evaluation report displayed on DGHS Punjab website on 16.12.2019 that our under mentioned items are not qualified in this tender due to less grading / short Numbering. Details are as under:- ITEM NO. 29 (Expectorant Syp/Susp. (Ammonium Chloride + CPM / Diphenhydramine + Menthol and others). Bottle of 120 ml or less. S.NO TECHNICAL CRITERIA TOTAL MARKS MARKES OBTAINED REMARKS 2 EXPERIENCE OF THE QUOTED PRODUCT SINCE JULY 2017 TO JUNE 2018 (In Private Sector) 10 0 Our sale of this product is more than 100% of the advertised quantity in private sector. Sale Summary attached (Please Revalidate) 4. CREDIBILITY AND CERTIFICATION OF MANUFACTURER Valid ISO 14001 (Environment Management System (EMS) certificate) 3 0 Valid ISO 14001 attached. Rectification Assessment Letter attached (Please Revalidate 9. Primary Reference Standard used for Quality Control Testing / Analysis of quality item 2 0 Import / Shipping Documents and Certificate of analysis are attached (Please Revalidate) ITEM NO. 46 (Tab. Atenolol 50mg, Pack of 20 or less, Blister Packing, Packed in carton with leaflet) S.NO TECHNICAL CRITERIA TOTAL MARKS MARKES OBTAINED	Mr.Bilal & Mr.Asim Mirza from M/s Nabiqasim Industries (Private) Limited. attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that firm provided ISO 14001 that is accepted and (3) marks are being awarded. Private sector sales data of item NO. 29 Rexyl Cough Syrup (Expectorant Syp/Susp. (Ammonium Chloride + CPM / Diphenhydramine + Menthol and others) was re-checked that is verified and is more than 75 % of the advertised quantity so (7) marks are being awarded. Primary Reference Standard was not verified. Now total marks are 48 instead of 38 and the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to" **Responsive".** 2.Private sector sales data of item NO. 46 (Tab. Atenolol 50mg Normitab Tablet 50mg was re-checked that is not verified. Primary Reference Standard was not verified. firm provided ISO 14001 that is accepted and (3) marks are being awarded. Now total marks are 43 instead of 40 and the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to**" Responsive".**

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
		100mg/ 5ml Paracet amol suspens ion		REMARKS 2 EXPERIENCE OF THE QUOTED PRODUCT SINCE JULY 2017 TO JUNE 2018 (In Private Sector) 10 0 Our sale of this product is more than 100% of the advertised quantity in private sector. Sale Summary attached (Please Revalidate) 4. CREDIBILITY AND CERTIFICATION OF MANUFACTURER Valid ISO 14001 (Environment Management System (EMS) certificate) 3 0 Valid ISO 14001 attached. Rectification Assessment Letter attached (Please Revalidate ITEM NO. 33 (Syp. Chlorpheniramine maleate 2mg / 5ml, bottle of 120ml or less) S.NO TECHNICAL CRITERIA TOTAL MARKS MARKES OBTAINED REMARKS 4. CREDIBILITY AND CERTIFICATION OF MANUFACTURER Valid ISO 14001 (Environment Management System (EMS) certificate) 3 0 Valid ISO 14001 attached. Rectification Assessment Letter attached (Please Revalidate ITEM NO. 58 (Suspension Cefixime 100mg/5ml. Bottle of 30 ml,) S.NO TECHNICAL CRITERIA TOTAL MARKS MARKES OBTAINED REMARKS 4. CREDIBILITY AND CERTIFICATION OF MANUFACTURER Valid ISO 14001 (Environment Management System (EMS) certificate) 3 0 Valid ISO 14001 attached. Rectification Assessment Letter attached (Please Revalidate In the light of above mentioned provided documents. It is requested to please give additional marks in our above mentioned items of said technical offer for healthy competition and in the best interest of needy peoples. Your cooperation in this regard will be much appreciated. We assure you our best cooperation.	3.Private sector sales data of item NO. 33 (Syp. Chlorpheniramine maleate 2mg / 5ml, Allergex Syrup was re-checked that is not verified. Primary Reference Standard was not verified. Firm provided ISO 14001 that is accepted and (3) marks are being awarded. Now total marks are 43 instead of 40 and the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to" **Responsive".** 4.Private sector sales data of item NO. 58 (Suspension Cefixime 100mg/5ml, Cefexol Dry Suspension 30ml was re-checked that verified and is more than 100 % of the advertised quantity so additional (03) marks are being awarded (total 10 marks in Private sales data and 07 marks already given in TER). Primary Reference Standard was not verified. Firm provided ISO 14001 that is accepted and (3) marks are being awarded. Now total marks are 46 instead of 40 and the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to**" Responsive".** 5. Firm requested the committee to address the grievance regarding paracetamol suspension, the committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that it was request rather than grievance of the said item as it was received after closing date of receiving of grievance applications so cannot be entertained so rejected the request of firm and the status of the item is unchanged and GRC upheld the decision of TEC and status of item will be remained same as **"Non-Responsive"**
24	Global Pharmaceutic als (Pvt.) Ltd.	Ceftriax one 1gm, Inj.Met oclopra mide 10mg/2 ml , Tab.Me toclopra mide	Non-Responsive	It is stated that we are the 25th largest pharmaceutical company in Pakistan and having a diverse portfolio of 350 products. Our plant is well equipped with latest and advance technology having GMP, ISO Certifications & latest HVAC Systems. Our company is also pre-qualified and registered with the DGHS Punjab, Armed Forces, Defense, PKLI, MCC KPK, Health Department Sindh, MSD Quetta etc. as well as with other central and provincial governments. It has come to our knowledge through Technical Evaluation report for the bulk purchase of medicines/Drugs Director General Health Services Punjab for financial year 2019-2020 we are Non Responsive because of following reasons. T.Sr. No REASON REMARKS	Mr. Kashif Rafique from M/s Global Pharmaceuticals (Pvt.) Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that firm provided Declaration of Non- Spurious adulterated drugs that was accepted by GRC and stability chambers data was provided and firm has 6 stability chambers so (6) marks are awarded. 1.Private sector and public sales data of item Ceftriaxone 1gm (Norbac) was re-checked that is verified and is more than 25 % of the advertised quantity

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
		10mg, Cap. Cefixime 400mg, Syp. Cefixime 100mg/ 5ml 30m Cap. Doxycycline 100mg		14. Inj. Ceftriaxone 1gm •FDA approved API number not given. • FDA approved Source. •Public sales • Sales undertaking attached. •Stability Chambers • 6 stability chambers Undertaking attached. • Real time study • Long Term stability study attached. 31- Inj.Metoclopramide 10mg/2ml • Market sales numbers not given. • Market Sales Undertaking attached. • Public Sales numbers not given. • Public sector Sales undertaking attached • Stability Chambers • 6 stability chambers Undertaking attached. • Real time study • Long Term stability study attached • Certificate of Analysis • Certificate of analysis attached. 32- Tab.Metoclopramide 10mg • Market sales numbers not given. • Market Sales Undertaking attached. • Public Sales numbers not given. • Public sector Sales undertaking attached • Stability Chambers • 6 stability chambers Undertaking attached. • Real time study • Long Term stability study attached • Certificate of Analysis • Certificate of analysis attached. 57- Cap. Cefixime 400mg • Accelerated Study. • Accelerated Study attached • Real Time study. • Long Term stability study attached • Certificate of Analysis. • Certificate of analysis attached T.Sr. No REASON REMARKS 58- Syp. Cefixime 100mg/5ml 30ml • Stability Chambers • 6 stability chambers Undertaking attached. • Real time study • Long Term stability study attached • Certificate of Analysis • Certificate of analysis attached. 60- Cap. Doxycyclin 100mg • Stability Chambers • 6 stability chambers Undertaking attached. • Real time study • Long Term stability study attached • Certificate of Analysis • Certificate of analysis attached. As per guidelines given by the committee (Before Submitting the bid) that every company will submit their Single Technical bid for all items so we have followed the same, however we are submitting required undertaking item Wise. 1. Declaration of Non- Spurious adulterated Product (6 No of undertaking on judicial stamp paper of worth Rs.100/-). 2. Declaration of availability of Six (6) Stability Chamber (5 No of undertaking on judicial stamp paper of worth Rs.100/-). Our products are freely available in the pharmaceutical market all over Pakistan and is being prescribed by the well-known KOL's. Kindly look into the matter before deciding anything and give us the	so additional (03) marks are being awarded in Private sector sales and (3) in Public sector sales. API source for US FDA was not verified. Provided Real time stability data was not as per evaluation criteria. Now total marks are 44 instead of 32 and the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to**" Responsive".** 2. Private sector and public sales marks of Inj.Metoclopramide 10mg/2ml have been already given in TER. Real time stability data was not as per evaluation criteria. Now total marks have become 46 instead of 40 and the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to**" Responsive".** 3. Private sector sales of Tab. Metoclopramide 10mg have been already given in TER. Public sector sales was not verified. Real time stability data was not as per evaluation criteria. Now total marks have become 39 instead of 33 but the status of the item is unchanged and GRC upheld the decision of TEC and status of item Tab. Metoclopramide 10mg will be remained same as **"Non-Responsive"** 4. Private sector sales of Cap. Cefixime 400mg have been already given in TER. Public sector sales was not verified. Real time stability data was not as per evaluation criteria. Reference standard data was provided and (2) marks are awarded. Now total marks have become 46 instead of 38 and the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to**" Responsive".** 5. Private sector sales of - Syp. Cefixime 100mg/5ml 30ml have been already given in TER. Public sector sales was not verified. Real time stability data was not as per evaluation criteria. Reference standard data was provided and (2) marks are awarded. Now total marks have become 41 instead of 33 but the status of the item is unchanged and GRC upheld the decision of TEC and status of item Syp. Cefixime 100mg/5ml 30ml will be remained same as **"Non-Responsive".** 6. Private sector sales of - Cap. Doxycycline 100mg have been already given in TER. Public sector sales was not verified. Real time stability data was not as per evaluation criteria. Reference standard data was provided and (2) marks are awarded. Now total marks have become 41 instead of 33 but the status of the item is unchanged and GRC upheld the decision of TEC and status of item Cap. Doxycycline 100mg will be remained same as **"Non-Responsive".**

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				opportunity to supply you the quality product on competitive rate. Thanking you.	
25	Mass Pharma (Pvt) Limited	Amlodipine Tablets 5 mg, Omeprazole Capsule 20mg Azithromycin Capsules 250mg, Cefixime Capsule 400mg, Ceftriaxone (Sodium) Injection 1gm (I.V), Ciprofloxacin (Hydrochloride) Tablets 500 mg	Non-Responsive	Dear Sir, It is submitted that we, M/s. Mass Pharma (Private) Limited have participated in the above mentioned process of RFP as manufacturer. But after reviewing the "Technical Evaluation Report", it was learnt that our above item has been marked "Non Responsive". However, seeking the opportunity to appear in the grievances, we are hereby submitting following documents to fulfill / meet the evaluation criteria for review by the competent authority / committee: 1. Sales summary on stamp paper mentioning sales in Private + Public sector. 2. Copy of Chemical Analysis Test Report (waste water) along with SoPs of Effluent Control. 3. Undertaking on stamp paper regarding Non – Declaration of Sub-standard samples by DTL. 4. Undertaking on stamp paper regarding availability of functional 3 Stability Chambers along with list of equipment of Quality Control Department and copy of valid calibration certificates. 5. Undertaking on stamp paper regarding availability of dedicated Reefer Containers for supply of medicines. 6. Copy of Import / Shipping Documents and Certificate of Analysis (COA) of Primary Reference Standard. 7. Copy of list of technical staff mentioning total number of Pharmacists. In view of the above, we the management of M/s. Mass Pharma (Pvt) Limited would like to request your honor to kindly make it convenient to review our evaluation once again and grant us approval for the financial year 2019 – 2020, assuring your honor that if we have been given a chance for provision of Medicines, we commit ourselves to supply a high quality product by fulfilling all legal requirements of GMP, if our firm / product is accepted accordingly. Assuring you for our best cooperation.	Mr.Usman Sulehry from M/s Mass Pharma (Pvt) Limited attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that firm provided SOP is not as per standards and no layout plan attached. Firm provide relevant document regarding stability chamber that are 03 in number so (3) marks are awarded. Firm provided undertaking on stamp paper regarding availability of dedicated Reefer Containers for supply of medicines that was accepted and (3) marks are given. Primary reference standard data of quoted item not provided as per evaluation criteria. Technical staff data was not provided as per evaluation criteria.so total 6 marks are added in TER of quoted items Amlodipine Tablets 5 mg, Omeprazole Capsule 20mg Azithromycin Capsules 250mg, Cefixime Capsule 400mg, Ceftriaxone (Sodium) Injection 1gm (I.V), Ciprofloxacin (Hydrochloride) Tablets 500 mg. Status of the firm for all quoted items is unchanged and still same as "**Non-Responsive".**
26	Searle IV Solutions (Pvt.) Limited Lahore.	Azithromycin 250 (cyzit) Ringer	Non-Responsive	The Director General Health Services Punjab, Government of Punjab, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department, 24-Cooper Road, Lahore Subject: REQUEST FOR (GRIEVANCE) FOR RFP OF PHARMACEUTICAL MANUFACTURING UNITS AND SOLE AGENTS OF FOREIGN PRINCIPALS FOR DRUGS/MEDICINES AND MEDICAL	Mr. Muhammad Farooq from M/s Searle IV Solutions (Pvt.) Limited Lahore attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report.

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
		Lactate 1000ml) macsola te		DEVICES 2019-2020 FOR P&SHD Dear Sir, Kindly refer to your evaluation report for RFP of manufacturing units for the year 2019-20, on the subject cited above, we are enclosing herewith the following document for your kind perusal and record: Therefore, we would like to request you to kindly accept our greivence of our firm for RFP for the year 2019-20. Thanking you, Yours truly, for Searle IV Solutions (Pvt.) Limited	The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that waste water treatment plant SOP is not as per standards and no layout provided. Private sector sales data of item Azithromycin 250 (cyzit)was not verified. Firm provided Public sector sales data that was re-checked that was less than 25 % of the advertised quantity so no mark will be awarded. Primary reference standards and staff data is not as per evaluation criteria so no mark will be given. Real time stability data was provided that was not as per evaluation criteria. Now the total marks will be remained same as per TER that are 26 and the status of item is unchanged and GRC upheld the decision of TEC and status of items will be remained same as **"Non-Responsive"** For item no 36 refer to decision of Unisa pharmaceutical industries LTD at serial no. 27
27	Unisa pharmaceutic al industries LTD	(Metron idazole 500mg/ 100ml) and 36 (Ringer Lactate 1000ml)	Non-Responsive	Ref:Pb/Evl1/01-19/G-19/20 Dated: Dec 26, 2019 The Directorate Health Services, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department, 24, Cooper Road, Lahore Subject: GREIVENCES ON EVALUATION REPORT OF PREQUALIFICATION FOR THE YEAR 2019-2020. Dear sir, In reference to the cited subject, grievances of 25-A (Metronidazole 500mg/100ml) and 36 (Ringer Lactate 1000ml) the deficient documents required from your good office are attached with this letter for both items applied. Which are as under; • Item 25-A Metronidazole o Supply of the quoted product (Private) o Supply of the quoted product (Public) o Waste Water Treatment Plant o Sub-standard by DTL o No of Functional Stability Chamber o Real Time Stability Study o Primary Reference Standard o Total Number Of Pharmacist • Item 36 Ringer Lactate o Supply of the quoted product (Private) o Waste Water Treatment Plant o Sub-standard by DTL o No of Functional Stability Chamber o Real Time Stability Study o Primary Reference Standard o Total Number Of Pharmacist Please, acknowledge this letter and attached documents and oblige. For and Behalf, UNISA PHARMACEUTICAL IND LTD	Mr.Zeshan from M/s Unisa pharmaceutical industries LTD attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. Firm representative further stated before the Committee that Ringer lactate is large volume infusion and mainly supplied to institutions hence, private sale criteria is not applicable for large volume infusions. Keeping in view the firm's grievance application and statement of the representative of the firm before the committee Grievance Redressal committee refer back the evolution of item no. 36 (Ringer Lactate) to Technical Evolution Committee. For item no. 25 refer to decision of Sanofi-Aventis Pakistan limited at serial no. 2

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
28	Macter International Limited	CO-AMOXI SUSPEN SION 312.50 MG 60 ml	Responsive	The Chairman Grievance Committee Dated: 24.12.2019 Directorate General Health Services Punjab 24-Cooper Road Lahore. Sub: GRIEVANCE TO RE-CONSIDER TECHNICAL MARKS OF OUR AMOXICILLIN + CLAVULANIC ACID SUSPENSION 250MG + 62.5MG / 5ML (CO-AMOXI SUSPENSION 312.50MG) (S.NO. 118, P.Q. NO .26 & T.E. NO. 12)__ Respected Sir Please refer to your published bid evaluation report in which our subject mentioned quoted item awarded 42 marks in which 3marks of Sale in Private Sector were missed. In this regard, it is humbly requested that our Sale in Private Sector is more than 25% of advertised quantity i.e. 1,000,000 bottles. So kindly award 3 marks. We are also enclosing following documents for your kind consideration: • IMS Data • Undertaking on Stamp Paper (already submitted in our bid). • Sales Summary (already submitted in our bid). You are requested that above mentioned 3 additional marks may please be added in our current 42 marks and total marks will be 45. Thanking you. Yours truly, for Macter International Ltd.	Mr. Mumtaz Zaidi from M/s Macter International Limited attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that item CO-AMOXI SUSPENSION 312.50MG 60 ml private sales is above the 25% sales of advertised quantity so (3) marks are awarded. In TER marks were 42 but M/s GSK filed grievance against M/s Macter claiming to re-check the sales of said item but the quoted item of M/s Macter was 60 ml susp instead of 90ml. After rechecking it was found that (3) marks have been deducted from the total marks awarded as per TER. So 39 marks remained. GRC accepted the grievance of the firm M/s macter and now total obtained marks are again 42 for that item and status of the item CO-AMOXI SUSPENSION 312.50MG 60ml is declared as **Responsive.**
29	Abbott Laboratories(Pakistan)Limi ted	Diclofen ac Sodium Ferrous Salt Metfor min	Non-Responsive	Reference to your evaluation Report Dated 16-12-19 we are surprised to see that we are not responsive in three items 129,163,220. We submitted all the documents as per evaluation criteria on portal and as well as in shape of hard copy. Sir, the evaluation team complied us against compulsory criteria but did not give us marks on the following points of our five quoted items as below in the section of ordinary parameters (marking criteria). PQ Inquiry Number Generic Name Source of API Experience in Public Sector Valid ISO 14001/ EMS/EHS No. of Functional Stability Chambers Logistic System Primary Reference Standard (Sr. No.01) (Sr. No.3) (Sr. No.04) (Sr. No.06) (Sr. No.07) (Sr. No.09) 129 Diclofenac Sodium 5 0 0 0 0 0 163 Ferrous Salt 5 0 0 0 0 2 220 Metformin Ok 0 0 0 0 0 190 Brufen Susp. Ok 7 0 0 0 0 191 Brufen Tab Ok 10 0 0 0 0 Sir, we assure you that all the documents were submitted properly with sign stamp and page marking. It may be overlook by the evaluation committee or missing in the portal due to software program. So, we are again submitting the same documents for your kind perusal. Kindly consider our grievance and restore our status as	Mr.Suleman from M/s Abbott Laboratories(Pakistan)Limited attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that firm provided details of 7 functional stability chamber so (6) marks are awarded. Firm provided undertaking of Logistic System refer container supply that is accepted and (3) marks are awarded. Waste water treatment plant layout was not provided. No ISO 14001 provided. 1.Private sector sales for artifen 50mg tablets data was re-checked that verified and is more than 100 % of the advertised quantity so (10) marks are being awarded Primary Reference Standard was not verified. Now total marks are 54 instead of 35 and the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to" **Responsive".**

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				responsive for healthy competition for PQ. Inquiry No. 129, 163, 220, 190 & 191. Yours truly, Abbott Laboratories (Pakistan) Limited.	1.Private sector sales for Iberet folic 500-tab data was re-checked that is not verified. Primary Reference Standard was not verified. Now total marks are 46 instead of 37 and the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to" **Responsive".** 1.Private sector sales for Neophage 500-tab data was re-checked that is not verified. Primary Reference Standard was not verified. Now total marks are 44 instead of 35 and the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to" **Responsive".**
30	Atco Laboratories Limited	Misoprostol 200 mcg tablets. Salbutamol solution 5mg/ml (Bronkal 20 ml	Non-Responsive	Misoprostol 200 mcg tablets (prosotec) and Salbutamol solution 5mg/ml (Bronkal), private sale data is attached. Waste water treatment plan data is attached. and we are providing undertaking on stamp paper to visit our manufacturing plant to confirm waste water treatment plan.	Mr.Faisal from M/s Atco Laboratories Limited attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that firm provided waste water treatment plant SOP and Layout plan is not as per standards so no mark will be awarded. 1.Private sector sales data of Misoprostol 200 mcg tablets (prosotec)) was re-checked and found that sales of said item is more than 100 % of advertised quantity so (10) marks are being awarded. Now total marks are 46 instead of 36 and the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to" **Responsive".** 2. Private sector sales data of Salbutamol solution 5mg/ml (Bronkal 20 ml respirator solution) was re-checked that is verified and is more than 100 % of the advertised quantity so (10) marks are being awarded. Now total marks have become 46 instead of 36 and the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to" **Responsive".**
31	Sante Private Limited	Zithrosan 250mg	Non-Responsive	With reference to above mentioned subject we have re-attached following documents for reconsideration: 1.Private Sector Sales Zithrosan 250mg 2.Sales Summary (Public Sector) Printed on Stamp Paper 3.ISO 9001-2015 (Cert. No. 191602 Validity 20201026) 4.ISO 14001-2015	Mr.Sohail from M/s Sante Private Limited attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				(Cert. No. EMS 191603 Validity 20201026) 5.ISO 45001-2018 (Cert. No. OH&S 191604 Validity 20201026) 6.MN-034-01 (Chemical Treatment of Sanitary Process Waste Water) 7.AM-28 (Accelerated Stability Data Zithrosan Capsule 250mg) 8.AM-28 (Regular Stability Data Zithrosan Capsule 250mg) You are requested to re-consider our case	committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that firm provided ISO 14001 certificate that is valid and already (3) marks are given in TER. Waste water treatment SOP & Layout plan not provided. 1 Private and public sector sales of quoted item (Zithrosan 250mg) was re-checked and not verified. Accelerated stability study marks are already awrded. Firm provided data regarding Realtime stability study that was accepted by GRC so (1) mark is being awarded. now total marks have become 36 instead of 35 but the status of the item is unchanged and GRC upheld the decision of TEC and status of items will be remained same as **"Non-Responsive"**
32	Bosch Pharmaceuticals (pvt) Ltd.	Cap. Azithromycin 250 mg and inj. Gentamycin 80 mg.	Non_responsive	We have already submitted the sales summary of private sales data since January 2018 up till closing date of tender. pls reconsider marks in Cap. Azithromycin 250 mg and inj. Gentamycin 80 mg. Month wise detail od sales is attached. invoices are attached and IMS(PKPI) are attached for your reference.	Mr.Haq Nawaz from M/s **Bosch Pharmaceuticals (pvt) Ltd.**. attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that 1. firm provided sales data of items Cap. Azithromycin 250 mg (Zezot 250 mg cap) .sales data was re checked and found that sales of zezot 250 cap is more than the advertised quantity in private sector sales so 10 marks are being awarded to the firm for that item.Now total marks are 51 instead of 41 the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to" **Responsive.** 2-Private sector sales data of inj. Gentamycin 80 mg (Gentic 80 mg inj) was re-checked and found that private sector sales is above the 75% of the total advertised quantity so (7) marks are being awarded. Now total marks are 45 instead of 38 the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to" **Responsive".**
33	Ferozsons laboratories Limited	(Atenorm 50 mg tablets)	Non-Responsive	Ref.To TER pls find attached documents as Experience of item atenolol 50 mg tab in private and public sector sales. Waste water treatment data is also submitted it is request to accept our grievance and re-evaluate it.	Mr. M.Muzammil from M/s **Ferozsons laboratories Limited** attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report.

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
					The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that Waste water treatment SOP & Layout plan is not as per standards. Private of quoted item (Atenorm 50 mg tablets) was re-checked that is verified and is more than 100 % of the advertised quantity so (10) marks are being awarded and public sector sales was re-checked that is more than 50% of the advertised quantity so (5) marks are being awarded. now total marks have become 43 Now total marks are 43 instead of 28 the status of the item is changed and GRC accepted the grievance of said item and status is changed from non-responsive to" **Responsive"."**
34	Wimits Pharmaceuticals (Pvt.) Ltd	no. 6 (IBUPROFEN 100MG/5ML) item 7(SOLO-CIP 500MG) , item no. 27(ORAY 20MG) , item no. 44(ASKAT 10MG) , item no. 47(WIMLOX 20MG/120MG) item no. 50(TRANZA 500MG/	Non-Responsive	With reference your technical evaluation report RFP uploaded on 16-12-19, on web portal of P&SHD. We hereby re-attached the required documents against in which we have not been given the marks to qualify the evaluation criteria. The detail of required documents is attached herewith for your ready reference.	Mr. Bhatti from Wimits Pharmaceuticals (Pvt.) Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report GRC decided that Firm provided real time stability data and accelerated stability data for item no. 6 (IBUPROFEN 100MG/5ML) item 7(SOLO-CIP 500MG) , item no. 27(ORAY 20MG) , item no. 44(ASKAT 10MG) , item no. 47(WIMLOX 20MG/120MG) item no. 50(TRANZA 500MG/5ML) and item no 60 (MICRODOX 100MG) was acceptable hence grievance of the firm was accepted and 2 marks granted for stability data category. Firm provided required undertaking regarding refer container as per advertised marking criteria of bidding documents hence grievance firm accepted for this parameter and 3 marks granted in this category. Firm provided undertaking regrading blacklisting/debarred was acceptable hence, grievance of the firm is accepted in this regard. Firm grievance regarding degree of employed pharmacist was also accepted hence grievance of the firm accepted in this regard and 5 marks granted for this category. Firm provided wastewater treatment plant documents and evidence are are not up to the required/prescribed standard hence firm grievance was rejected for this parameter.

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
		5ML) and item no 60 (MICRO DOX 100MG)			Firm Provided valid ISO 14001 hence grievance of the firm was also accepted on this regard and 3 marks awarded for this category. Firm provided valid GMP certificate hence grievance of the firm was also accepted to the extent of this category. Firm provided documents for primary reference standard for item no. 6 (IBUPROFEN 100MG/5ML) & item 7(SOLO-CIP 500MG) which was fond acceptable hence grievance of the firm was accepted in this regard and 2 marks granted for item for no. 6 (IBUPROFEN 100MG/5ML) & item 7(SOLO-CIP 500MG). Firm provided private sector sale data for item no. 6 (IBUPROFEN 100MG/5ML) item 7(SOLO-CIP 500MG) , item no. 27(ORAY 20MG) , item no. 44(ASKAT 10MG) , item no. 47(WIMLOX 20MG/120MG) item 50(TRANZA 500MG/5ML) and item no 60 (MICRODOX 100MG for private sector is not verified hence grievance of the firm was rejected for this parameter. Firm provided public sector sale data (1386900 units) for item no. 6 (IBUPROFEN 100MG/5ML) which fall under category of 50-70% as per advertised criteria hence 5 marks added in category of public sale of item no. 6 (IBUPROFEN) 100MG/5ML. Furthermore M/s Abbott Lab. Pakistan file grievance against this item that M/s Wimitis pharma was wrongly granted 10 marks in category of API source upon inquiring represented of M/s Wimits pharma himself admitted that their source is not FDA approved and firm also denied to provide import trail of API hence 5 marks granted instead of 10 for this item and Total Marks of item no. 6 (IBUPROFEN 100MG/5ML) become 38 hence status of firm for item no. 6 (IBUPROFEN 100MG/5ML) remained **Non Responsive.** Firm provided public sector sale data (3915143 units) for item no. 7(SOLO-CIP 500MG) which falls between 25%-50% of advertised quantity hence 3 marks added for this category the total marks for this item 7(SOLO-CIP 500MG) become 41 and status remained for this item **Non Responsive.** Firm provided public sector sales data **(8375750 units) for** item no. 27(ORAY 20MG) which falls above 70% but less than 100% of advertised quantity hence 7 marks added for this category. During course of meeting it was also observed that source of API for this item "SPANSULES FORMULATIONS

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
					INDIA" is not FDA approved in addition FDA approval for SPANSULES FORMULATIONS INDIA was not verified from the official website of US FDA hence 5 marks granted in the category instead of 10 and the total marks for item no 27(ORAY 20MG) become 38 and status of item no 27(ORAY 20 mg) remained **Non Responsive**. Firm provided public sector sale data (427720 units) item no. 47(WIMLOX 20MG/120MG) which falls above 100% of advertised quantity hence 10 marks added for this category the total marks for this item no. 47 (WIMLOX 20MG/120MG) become 46 and status changed for this item to **Responsive.** Firm provided sales data fo**r** item no. 44(ASKAT 10MG), item no. 50(TRANZA 500MG/5ML) and item no 60 (MICRODOX 100MG) is less than 25% of respective advertised quantity hence grievance of the firm was rejected for these items. Hence, Status for item no. 44(ASKAT 10MG), item no. 50(TRANZA 500MG/5ML) and item no 60 (MICRODOX 100MG) remained unchanged and **Non Responsive**

<table>
<tr><th>Sr. No.</th><th>Firm Name</th><th>T.E. No.</th><th>TER Status</th><th>Grievance of the Firm</th><th>Decision of the Committee</th></tr>
<tr><td>35</td><td>Lisko Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd</td><td>Liskodryllin Syrup,HISTAGIC SYP,HYDRINATE LIQUID,IBU-PROFEN SUSP.,Flyzol Suspension, Monti tab 10mg

Wintol Syrup</td><td>Non-Responsive</td><td>With reference to technical evaluation report RFP, we would like to inform you that we, M/S Lisko Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd, is pre-qualified firm by DGHS, Punjab for the year 2019-20. We participated in the tender (RFP) by your department and quoted 7 items along with all required documents. We have been declared non-responsive as we have not secured qualifying marks i.e 42 marks. We have been given 0 marks under the following evaluation criteria: 1. Supply of quoted product in private sector (total 10 marks) 2. Supply of quoted product in Public sector (total 10 marks) 3. Details regarding quality of product i.e % of sub-standard batches of quoted product by DTL (Total 10 marks) In this regard, we would like to submit our grievance that we have submitted all required documents as per bidding documents i.e Summary of sale in private sector for each quoted item on Rs. 100/= stamp paper duly notarized, Summary of sale in public sector for each quoted item on Rs. 100/= stamp paper duly notarized along with purchase orders and Rs. 100/= stamp paper duly notarized regarding undertaking sub-standard batches. We also submitted DRC & renewal of all quoted items in our bid but technical evaluation report says that DRC of quoted items are not available. We assume that due to heavy documentation, technical evaluation committee overlooked documents submitted against above mentioned criteria for each quoted product resulted in scoring less marks declaring non-responsive. Since, all required documents are available in our technical bid, we claim following total marks against each quoted items: Item no 6: (ibu-profen susp) = 56 marks item no 20: (Dimenhydrinate liquid) = 56 marks item no 26: (Metronidazole susp) = 56 marks item no 29: (Syp Aminophyllin, amonium chloride,etc) = 56 marks item no 33: (Chloropheneramin melaeate syp) = 56 marks Item no 38: (Salbutamol Syp) = 56 marks item no 44: (Tab montelukast 10mg) = 53 marks For your ease in evaluation, we are again submitting all required documents against 3 said evaluation criteria. We request you to kindly allow us for personal hearing so that we can show you physically that all said documents required by you is already part of our bid and is exactly in accordance with your requirement / specification of RFP. So, kindly</td><td>Mr. Sarfraz from Lisko Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report GRC decided that

Firm provided DRC in bidding document and on online portal was acceptable hence grievance of the firm was accepted in this regard.

M/s Abbott Lab. Pakistan file grievance against item no. 6 (IBU-PROFEN SUSP. 100MG/5M), that M/s Lisko was granted wrongly 10 marks in category of API source GRC also found that API source of M/s Lisko i.e Zenith Chemical Industries (Pvt) Ltd, Lahore, Pakistan is not FDA approve hence 5 marks granted instead of 10 for this item in API category. Furthermore, GRC upon grievance of M/s Abbott GRC also observed that M/s Lisko for item no 6 (IBU-PROFEN SUSP. 100MG/5M) have 3 batches declared substandard by different DTLs of Punjab ie (batch no. 129,126and 135) which is more than1 % hence 5marks granted for this parameter to item no.5

Firm provided private sales data for item no. 6 (IBU-PROFEN SUSP. 100MG/5M), item no. 20 (HYDRINATE LIQUID 12.5mg/4ml), item no 26. Flyzol Suspension 200mg/5ml. Item no. 29 (Liskodryllin Syrup) item no.33 (HISTAGIC SYP 2mg/5ml) item no. 38(Wintol Syrup 2mg/5ml) & item no. 29 (Monti tab 10mg) which was not verified hence grievance of the firm was rejected in this regard.

Firm also provided public sales data for which marks are given as below
<table>
<tr><td>Item no</td><td>Quoted item</td><td>Marks granted for Public sector sale</td><td>Marks granted for DTL/quality of product</td><td>Total Marks after grievance</td><td>Status After grievance</td><td></td></tr>
</table>
</td></tr>
</table>

<table>
<tr><th>Sr. No.</th><th>Firm Name</th><th>T.E. No.</th><th>TER Status</th><th>Grievance of the Firm</th><th>Decision of the Committee</th></tr>
<tr><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>consider our request and qualify our firm and quoted items technically. Thanking you,</td><td>
<table>
<tr><td>06</td><td>IBU-PROFEN SUSP. 100MG/5M</td><td>10</td><td>5</td><td>39</td><td>Non Responsive</td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td>20</td><td>HYDRINATE LIQUID 12.5mg/4ml</td><td>10</td><td>10</td><td>49</td><td>Responsive</td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td>26</td><td>Flyzol Suspension 200mg/5m</td><td>10</td><td>10</td><td>49</td><td>Responsive</td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td>29</td><td>Liskodryllin Syrup</td><td>10</td><td>10</td><td>49</td><td>Responsive</td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td>33</td><td>HISTAGIC SYP 2mg/5ml</td><td>10</td><td>10</td><td>49</td><td>Responsive</td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td>38</td><td>Wintol Syrup 2mg/5ml</td><td>10</td><td>10</td><td>49</td><td>Responsive</td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td>29</td><td>Montitab 10mg</td><td>10</td><td>10</td><td>49</td><td>Responsive</td><td></td></tr>
</table>
</td></tr>
<tr><td>36</td><td>Star Laboratories</td><td>Bronil Syrup</td><td>Non-Responsive</td><td>Firm is aggrieved that compulsory criteria of 2% bid security and specification was not considered, furthermore firm also stated that marks are not given in primary reference Standard real time stability studies and for supply of product in private sector</td><td>Mr. Manzoor from Star Lab (Pvt.) Ltd attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the viewpoint of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report GRC decided that

Firm provided copy of 2% bid security which is acceptable, and specification are also correct hence grievance of the firm was accepted for both compulsory criteria.</td></tr>
</table>

Sr. No.	Firm Name	T.E. No.	TER Status	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
					Firm claim regarding supply of quoted item did not verified hence grievance of the firm was rejected for this parameter. Provided Real time stability studies was conducted in 2011 however required stability studied should be conducted 2018 on word hence grievance of the firm was rejected for this parameter Firm provided working reference standard however primary reference standard should provide as per advertised criteria of bidding document hence grievance of the firm also rejected for this parameter. The status of firm quoted item no. 29 remained unchanged and **Non-Responsive.**