



PURCHASE CELL

DIRECTORATE GENERAL HEALTH
SERVICES PUNJAB
24-COOPER ROAD, LAHORE



Primary & Secondary
Healthcare Department

Phone No.: [+924299201145](tel:+924299201145)

Purchase Cell E-mail: pcdghslahore@gmail.com

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL COMMITTEE MEETING TO REDRESS THE GRIEVANCES OF THE FIRMS AGAINST THE TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT OF WIRELESS MICROPHONE SYSTEM AND INTERNET CONNECTIONS & NETWORKING IT EQUIPMENT FOR MIS CELL, LAB ITEMS OF T.B CONTROL PROGRAM, DISINFECTANT SOLUTION OF CDC PROGRAM, TYRES OF VEHICLES FOR TRANSPORT BRANCH AND RFP PHASE-II DRUGS/MEDICINES DURING FY 2018-2019, DIRECTORATE GENERAL HEALTH SERVICES, PUNJAB

A meeting of the Grievance Redressal Committee was held on 19-04-2019 at 3.00 P.M in committee room of Directorate General Health Services, Punjab, to redress the grievance applications submitted by the aggrieved firms, as per Rule 67 of Punjab Procurement Rules, 2014 (Amended).

Following members of Grievance Redressal Committee attended the meeting:

Sr. No.	Participants	
1.	Director Health Services (CDC), DGHS	Chairman/Convener
2.	Senior Medical Officer (EPI), DGHS	Member
3.	Senior Law Officer (Litigation Cell), DGHS	Member

Following member(s) presented the cases on behalf of the Technical Scrutiny / Bid Evaluation Committee:

Sr. No.	Member(s)
1.	Pharmacist, Purchase Cell, DGHS

The Chair welcomed the participants and briefed about agenda of meeting i.e. Grievance Redressal of firms against technical evaluation report of subject mentioned items of various programs & RFP Phase-II Drugs/Medicines during Fiscal Year 2018-2019.

The grievances of firms and decisions of grievance redressal committee made thereof are as follow:

Sr. No.	T.E. No.	Name of Item	Name of the Firm	Status as per Technical Evaluation Report	Reason(s) of Rejection	Grievance of the Firm	Decisions of the Grievance Redressal Committee
1	T.E. No. PC-01/MIS/2018-19	Wireless Audio / Microphone System	M/s World Wide Vision	Non-Responsive	No copy of 2% Bid Security is attached with technical bid.	The firm has submitted a grievance application against the technical evaluation report and stated that it had been declared non-responsive due to non submission of earnest money with technical proposal. It has enclosed copy of pay order with the application, the original of which is already attached with its financial proposal. The firm has requested to review the decision and consider its bid as responsive.	Mr. Ali, representatives of M/s World Wide Vision, appeared before the grievance redressal committee and briefed about the grievance. Although the firm has attached the copy of bid security with grievance application but upon perusal it was found that it was of less amount than required. The representative of the firm confessed that he has calculated and submitted the bid security according to quoted rate in financial proposal which has resulted in difference of submitted amount of bid security and required bid security. Moreover, the committee warned the firm to be careful next time and submit bid security according to estimated cost as given in tender in compliance to Rule 27 of Punjab Procurement Rules-2014. Therefore, the grievance of the firm is rejected and hence status of the firm, M/s World Wide Vision, is remains as “ Non-Responsive ”.
2	T.E. No. PC-01/MIS/2018-20	Wireless Audio / Microphone System	M/s Taha Enterprises	Non-Responsive	Amount of submitted 2% bid security is less than required.	The firm has submitted a grievance application against the technical evaluation report in which it has expressed that 2% bid security instrument (CDR) was prepared with understanding based on its bid price i.e. Rs. 1,720,000, whereas the requirement of procuring agency was 2% of estimated cost i.e. 1,725,000. Although difference is of Rs. 100 which can be waved keeping in view of the total tender cost, if not the it can provide CDR of Rs. 100 to cover the difference and deficiency in its bid documents as well. The firm has requested for kind consideration.	Mr. Sarwar, representatives of M/s Taha Enterprises, appeared before the grievance redressal committee and briefed about the grievance. The representative of the firm confessed that it has calculated and submitted the bid security according to quoted rate in financial proposal which has resulted in difference of submitted amount of bid security and required bid security. Moreover, the committee warned the firm to be careful next time and submit bid security according to estimated cost as given in tender in compliance to Rule 27 of Punjab Procurement Rules-2014. Therefore, its grievance is rejected and hence status of the firm, M/s Taha Enterprises, is declared as “ Non-Responsive ”.

Sr. No.	T.E. No.	Name of Item	Name of the Firm	Status as per Technical Evaluation Report	Reason(s) of Rejection	Grievance of the Firm	Decisions of the Grievance Redressal Committee
3	T.E. No. PC-03/MIS/2018-19	1. Main Router 2. Network Switch 3. Access Points 4. UPS 5. Accessories 6. Installation & Configuration	M/s Nayef Mohammed Al Harbi Group	Non-Responsive	1. Amount of 2% Bid Security could not be verified as it was hidden. 2. No Sole agent agreement/authorization from manufacturer is provided. 3. No evidence of local market business history is provided.	The firm has submitted a grievance application against the technical evaluation report in which it has explained that: i) It has attached original printed CDR with this application. ii) The firm is Govt. Contractor & General Order Supplier. It has successfully supplied the quoted brands in different DHQ's & THQ's Hospitals of Punjab. The purchase orders have been attached with this letter. iii) Evidence and local market business history was already covered in attached purchase orders previously in submitted bidding documents. Some purchase orders have been attached with this letter.	Mr. Umer Shaukat, representatives of M/s Nayef Mohammed Al Harbi Group, appeared before the grievance redressal committee and briefed about the grievance. The firm has furnished the copy of bid security of required amount, Sole agent agreement/authorization from manufacturer and purchase orders exhibiting the 3 years local market business history of the firm in compliance to compulsory parameters of knockdown criteria. Therefore, the grievance of the firm is accepted and hence status of the firm, M/s Nayef Mohammed Al Harbi Group, is declared as "Responsive" .
4	T.E. No. PC-3/T.B/2018-19	Glass Slides	M/s Three Stars	Non-Responsive	No undertaking is attached regarding non-conviction by any court of law on notarized judicial stamp paper of Rs. 100/-	The firm has submitted a grievance application against the technical evaluation report stating that it had attached the judicial stamp paper worth Rs. 100/- with the technical bid and also attached with technical bid after printing on company's letter head. Furthermore, if another stamp paper is required then it shall proved as per committee's decision. The firm has requested to re-evaluate its technical bid.	Mr. Ali Zafa, representatives of M/s Three Stars, appeared before the grievance redressal committee and briefed about the grievance. The firm has submitted the required undertaking thereby satisfying the compulsory parameter of knockdown criteria. Therefore, its grievance is accepted and hence status of the firm, M/s Three Stars, is declared as "Responsive" .

Sr. No.	T.E. No.	Name of Item	Name of the Firm	Status as per Technical Evaluation Report	Reason(s) of Rejection	Grievance of the Firm	Decisions of the Grievance Redressal Committee
5	T.E No. PC-3/T.B/2018-20	Sputum Container with Zip lock Bag	M/s Three Stars	Non-Responsive	1) No undertaking is attached regarding non-conviction by any court of law on notarized judicial stamp paper of Rs. 100/- 2) End-user rejected the sample after evaluation.	The firm has submitted a grievance application against the technical evaluation report stating that: i) It had attached the judicial stamp paper worth Rs. 100/- with the technical bid and also attached with technical bid after printing on company's letter head. Furthermore, if another stamp paper is required then it shall proved as per committee's decision. ii) It has requested to check/re-evaluate the sample against advertised specifications.	Mr. Ali Zafar, representatives of M/s Three Stars, appeared before the grievance redressal committee and briefed about the grievance. The firm has submitted the required undertaking thereby satisfying the relevant compulsory parameter of knockdown criteria. Moreover, the representative of firm explained that submitted sample fully comply to the given specifications. He added that the firm has supplied the stores with same specifications in previous years as well. Upon consultation and detailed deliberation regarding above said grievance of the firm with the end user, Mr. Sheraz Younas, Molecular Biologist, Provincial TB Reference Lab, the sample was re-evaluated and found complying to advertised specifications. Therefore, its grievance is accepted and hence status of the firm, M/s Three Stars, is declared as “Responsive” .
6	T.E No. PC-3/T.B/2018-21	Sputum Container with Zip lock Bag	M/s Bmitco	Non-Responsive	1) GST status is "Suspended" on FBR Website 2) End-user rejected the sample after evaluation.	The firm has submitted a grievance application against the technical evaluation report and explained that: i) The firm is active on FBR List (ALT), latest copy is attached. ii) It has offered same specs as required in bidding documents. iii) Sample which had been submitted was compliant to required specifications. iv) It has submitted the undertaking and signed the bid form and compliance of specifications already. Therefore, the firm has requested to re-evaluate the technical proposal in order to enhance healthy competition and transparent procurement process.	Mr. Zaheer Abbas, representatives of M/s Bmitco, appeared before the grievance redressal committee and briefed about the grievance. The representative stated that GST status of the firm is "Operative" now which was found to be true after verification from FBR Website. Furthermore, the submitted sample was rejected by end user in its report due to being not graduated and devoid of space of labeling. Therefore, its grievance is rejected and hence status of the firm, M/s Bmitco, is declared as “Non-Responsive” .

Sr. No.	T.E. No.	Name of Item	Name of the Firm	Status as per Technical Evaluation Report	Reason(s) of Rejection	Grievance of the Firm	Decisions of the Grievance Redressal Committee
7	T.E No. PC-3/CDC/2018-19	Disinfectant	M/s Bio Pharma	Non-Responsive	1) No Valid GMP Certificate/ISO 13485 of manufacturer is attached. 2) No Valid ISO/CE Certificate of manufacturer is attached	The firm has submitted a grievance application against the technical evaluation report stating that there is no company in Pakistan which have Hypochlorite 5% solution ISO 13485 certificate. In the past, it has supplied many times local hypochlorite 5% solution. The firm has requested to consider its grievance and decalre as responsive.	Mr. Muhammad Abbas, representatives of M/s Bio Pharma, appeared before the grievance redressal committee and briefed about the grievance. The representative stated that there is no Hypochlorite 5% solution manufacturing company in Pakistan which is ISO 13485 certified. The committee discussed for applicability of such parameters on said product. After due delibration it was decided that as the firm has failed to produce any evidence of standard quality certification of manufacturer. Therefore, its grievance is rejected and hence status of the firm, M/s Bio Pharma, is declared as “Non-Responsive” .
8	T.E No. PC-19/Transport/18-19	Tyres for: 1. Mitsubishi Double Cabin 2. Toyota Double Cabin 3. Foton Truck (Hino Truck) 4. Potohar Jeep (Suzuki) 5. Shahzor Loader	M/s A.R. Traders	Non-Responsive	1. No copy of CNIC of CEO/Owner is attached. 2. The bidder has not declared on notarized judicial stamp paper of Rs.100/-, the make, model & country of origin of all accessories to be provided with the product. 3. The bidder has not declared on notarized judicial stamp paper of Rs.100/- that it has never been blacklisted/debarred from any procuring agency and has not been convicted from any court of law. 4. No evidence of one year local market business history is available. 5. No evidence of availability of quoted products in major cities of Pakistan.	The firm has submitted a grievance application against the technical evaluation report in which it has stated that it has attached the following with the application: i) Copy of CNIC ii) Undertaking about authorized sale agent iii) Declaration of originalit of product iv) Undertaking regarding blacklisting from any procuring agency. v) Supply order to Govt. Institutions vi) Undertaking about availability in all over country. The firm has requested to approve its technical proposal through accepting the attached documents.	Mr. Abdul Rauf, representatives of M/s A.R. Traders, appeared before the grievance redressal committee and briefed about the grievance. As the firm has provided the CNIC copy of owner, required undertakings, purchase orders of Govt. Institutes as evidence of one year local market business history and undertaking regarding availability of quoted products in major cities of Pakistan thereby fulfilling the requirements of compulsory parameters of knockdown criteria. Therefore, its grievance is accepted and hence status of the firm, M/s A.R. Traders, is declared as “Responsive” .

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 19-04-2019

Sr.	Item Name	Firm Name	Quoted Specifications	Grievance of the Firm	Decisions of the Grievance Redressal Committee
1	Cap/Tab. Ciprofloxacin 500mg	NabiQasim Industries (Pvt) Limited Karachi	Brand :Tablet Bacip (Ciprofloxacin 500mg).Blister pack of 10,packed in cartoon with leaflet. DRN:055591 MRP:190/10 tab Mfg By: NabiQasim Industries (Pvt) Ltd. 17/24,Korangi Industrial Area,Karachi.	We have been disqualified due to less marks.We have supplied 2.4million tablets to B.V Hospital Bahawalpur during this financial year.our production capacity is approx five lac. Our waste water treatment plant is in instalation process and will be start very soon.SOP's and other relavent document aatched.Please revaldate.	The representative of firm Mr. Hafiz Bilal Institution Manager appeared before the committee and briefed its grievance.The representative of firm himself admitted that they have sale 2.4 million which is less th 25% of advertise quantity.The waste water treatment plant is not installed yet.Keeping in view of above and after due delibration committee unanimously decided to reject the grievance of firm.Hence,the status of the firm remains " Non-Responsive ".
2	Cap/Tab. Ciprofloxacin 500mg	Global Pharmaceuticals (Pvt) Ltd Islamabad	Brand :Tab Nafcin (Ciprofloxacin500mg.Alu Strip of 10 tablets packed in cartoon with leaflet. DRN:025577 MRP:160/10 Tablets. Mfg By: Global Pharmaceuticals(Pvt) Ltd.Plot No.204-205,Industrial Triangle Kahuta Road Islamabad-Pakistan.	We have attached National depot wise sales of market and IMS value wise sheet which reflects Rs.30 Million value estimated 25% unit wise sales of advertised quantity. We have attahced audit report of stage-1 and proposal for ready refrence .We have attached undertaking on Rs.100 stamp paper. our product are freely available in market all over Pakistan and is beng prescribed by well known KOL's. Kindly look into the matter before deciding anything and give us tghe opportunity o supply you quality product on competitive rate.	The representative of the firm Mr.Kashif Regional Head appered before the committee and briefed its grievance.The document submitted by the firm shows sale of Rs.30 million which is in terms of value which is not as per required criteria.The audit report of stage-1 submitted is not accepted by the committee.Undertaking on Rs.100 stamp paper submitted by the firm and is accepted.Hence 10 marks awarded for this.So total marks of the firm became 31.However the status of the firm remains non-responsive as the firm failed to obtain qualifying marks.
3	Inj. Hydrocortisone sodium succinate 100 mg, (Dry Powder)	Cirin Pharmaceuticals (Pbvt) Islamabad	Brand :Inj Hy-Cortisone 100mg.Individually packed in cartoon with leaflet, 5ml water for injection. DRN: (Inj):024424 DRN: (WFI):038788 Mfg By: Cirin Pharmaceuticals (Pvt) Ltd.32/2A Phase III,Industrial Estate Hattar- Pakistan.	We have been given zero marks against the experience.The product is being extensively used in Government institution,armed forces and prescribed by the senior consultant throughout the country.They have already attached experience of quoted product and enclosing again.Review the case and award us 20 marks enabling fair competition.	The representative of the firm Mr. Monam Khan appered before the committee and briefed its grievance.The PO issued by P&SHD presented by the firm was considered by the committee.Documents of commercial sale submitted by the firm were not verified.Hence,only 10 marks given for experience.Total marks of the firm became 33.However,the staus of the firm remains non-responsive as the firm failed to obtain qualifying marks.