



PURCHASE CELL

DIRECTORATE GENERAL HEALTH
SERVICES PUNJAB
24-COOPER ROAD, LAHORE



Primary & Secondary
Healthcare Department

Phone No.: [+924299201145](tel:+924299201145)

Purchase Cell E-mail: pcdghslahore@gmail.com

MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL COMMITTEE HELD ON 5th May, 2020 AT 02:30 P.M TO REDRESS THE GRIEVANCE APPLICATIONS OF THE FIRMS AGAINST TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORTS FOR THE PROCUREMENT OF PPE's /CHEMICALS/DISINFECTANTS PHASE-IV FOR PREVENTION & CONTROL OF COVID-19 OUTBREAK DURING FY 2019-20 ON EMERGENCY BASIS .

A meeting of the Grievance Redressal Committee was held on 05-05-2020 at 02:30 P.M in committee room of Directorate General Health Services, Punjab, to address the grievances of the applicants, as per Rule 67 of Punjab Procurement Rules, 2014 (Amended), for the procurement of PPE's/Chemicals/Disinfectants Phase-IV for prevention & control of Novel Corona (COVID-19) during FY 2019-20 on emergency basis.

Following members of Grievance Redressal Committee attended the meeting:

Sr. No.	Participants	
1.	Director Health Services (CD&EPC), DGHS	Chairman/Convener
2.	Director Pharmacy, DGHS	Member
3.	Senior Law Officer (Litigation Cell), DGHS	Member

Following member(s) of the Technical Evaluation Committee presented the cases on behalf of the Technical Evaluation Committee:

Sr. No.	Member(s)
1.	Pharmacist (M&E), DGHS

The Chair welcomed all the participants and briefed about agenda of meeting i.e. Grievance Redressal for the procurement of PPE's/Chemicals/Disinfectants Phase-IV for prevention & control of Novel Corona (COVID-19) during FY 2019-20 on emergency basis. The Chair instructed the representatives of aggrieved firms to come one by one serial wise based on receipt of grievance so that proper hearing/ redressal of grievance may be ensured. The grievances of firms and decisions of grievance redressal committee are as follow

Sr.	NAME OF THE FIRM & ITEM	Name of Quoted Item	STATUS	REASON (S) OF REJECTION	GREVIANCE OF THE FIRM	DECISIONS OF THE GREVIANCE COMMITTEE
01	M/s Four Brothers	KN95 Mask particulate respirator Yihu Kang Healthy	Non-Responsive	The sample of quoted product does not conform to given specifications	M/s Four Brothers The firm submitted the grievance against the technical evaluation committee report that the firm quoted the same to N95 masks and supplied samples clearly marks as N95 with EN 149 according to the tender specifications, whereas sample evaluation committee showed to quoted sample as KN95 instead of N95 and rejecting by stating the sample does not confirm to given specification.	The grievance redressal committee examined the submitted grievance of the M/s Four Brothers in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The grievance committee after due deliberation and discussion did not accept the grievance of the firm. Hence the status of the firm M/s Four Brothers is declared as Non-Responsive .
02	M/s Cotlinks Systematic Business Solution	1.Face masks with nose pin 2.Face masks without nose pin	Non-Responsive	1.Copy of NTN/GST Missing. 2.Proof of Active Tax payer missing. 3.The sample of quoted product does not conform to given specifications	M/s Cotlinks Systematic Business Solution The firm submitted the grievance against the technical report of the against the quotation of surgical masks with the following documents 1. NTN Certificate 2. Active Tax payer The reason of rejection of the sample of face mask is not valid and according to the submitted sample of face mask which is 20gm/m ² +20gm/m ² +20gm/m ² three ply non-woven fabric	The grievance redressal committee examined the submitted grievance of the M/s Cotlinks Systematic Business Solution in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail that firm provided; 1. Copy of NTN/GST which is accepted 2. Proof of Active Tax Payer list which is accepted However, sample specification of quoted product was not as per advertised specification due to which its grievance is not accepted. Hence the status of the firm M/s Cotlinks Systematic Business Solution is declared as

						Non-Responsive against its grievance application.
03	M/s Alwaali Care Concepts	1.AWC Concepts Surgical Mask Pakistan 2.AWC Concepts Face Shield Pakistan	Non-Responsive	The sample of quoted product does not conform to given specifications	M/s Alwaali Care Concepts The firm submitted the grievance against the technical report of the PPEs Phase-iv and stated that quoted surgical face masks are as per advertised specifications and firm already supplied the said stock to the DGHS office. Similarly, the face Shield also as per advertised specifications and firm already supplied the said stock to the children hospital, Lahore Please reconsider the evaluation accordingly.	The representative of M/s Alwaali care Concepts attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the advertised specifications found that the specifications of quoted products does not comply and upheld the decision of Technical Evaluation Committee. Therefore, grievance of the firm is not accepted. Hence the status of the firm M/s Al-waali is declared as Non-Responsive against its grievance application.
04	M/s Iftikhar Ali Enterprises	Face Shield Local	Non-Responsive	1. Undertaking on valid Rs.100 judicial stamp paper duly verified by notary public, that Bidder/Firm shall supply the stores of quoted item(s) within given delivery schedule. 2.Sample Not Provided	M/s Iftikhar Ali Enterprises The firm submitted the grievance against the technical evaluation report and stated that the firm submitting the sample along with the grievance request of Face Shield dully imported from the china which may kindly be examined technically and considered our item technically responsive.	The grievance redressal committee examined the submitted grievance of the M/s Iftikhar Ali Enterprises in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail that undertaking regarding delivery schedule is accepted. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters accepted the undertaking regarding delivery schedule. Moreover, keeping in view the advertised specifications found that the specifications of quoted product does not comply and upheld the decision of Technical Evaluation Committee.

						Therefore, grievance of the firm is not accepted. Hence the status of the firm M/s Iftikhar Ali Enterprises is declared as Non-Responsive against its grievance application.
05	M/s Alfateh Enterprises	1.KN95 Face Mask 2.Surgical Face Mask Local	Non-Responsive	1.Undertaking on valid Rs.100 judicial stamp paper duly verified by notary public, that Bidder/Firm shall supply the stores of quoted item(s) within given delivery schedule not provided 2.Sample not Provided	M/s Alfateh Enterprises The firm submitted the grievance against the technical evaluation report with the following points: 1. Firm has submitted sample of N95 Face mask duly imported from China for technical evaluation. 2. Firm has submitted the under taking on judicial stamp paper of Rs. 100	The representative of M/s Alfateh Enterprises attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters accepted the undertaking regarding delivery schedule. Moreover, the firm did not provide the sample of KN95 Face Mask at the time of bid opening as well as sample evaluation and keeping in view the COVID-19 emergency timelines decided to not accept the sample presented before the grievance redressal committee. Therefore, grievance of the firm is not accepted in KN95 Mask and accepted in Surgical Face Mask. Hence the status of the firm M/s Alfateh Enterprises is declared as Responsive in Surgical Face Mask and declared as Non-Responsive in KN95 Mask respectively against its grievance application.
06	M/s Certopharma	Reko Hand Sanitizer	Non-Responsive	All undertakings on judicial stamp papers of Rs. 100 are missing	M/s Certopharm The firm submitted the grievance against technical evaluation report that the firm could not submitted the stamp papers during the submission of bid and firm is submitting the all undertaking with the grievance request.	The grievance redressal committee examined the submitted grievance of the M/s Certopharma in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail decided that as the firm has provided;

						<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Undertaking on valid Rs.100 judicial stamp paper that currently it is not Blacklisted/Debar red by any Federal, Provincial or Local Government Procuring 2. Undertaking on valid Rs.100 judicial stamp paper that it has never been convicted by any court of law. 3. Undertaking on valid Rs.100 judicial stamp paper that Bidder/Firm shall supply the stores of quoted item(s) within given delivery schedule otherwise procuring agency can make risk purchase on account of bidder/contracting firm. 4. Undertaking, on valid Rs.100 judicial stamp paper that the prices quoted to the Procuring Agency, against the item(s) mentioned at RFQ are not more than the Trade Prices as per MRP (Maximum Retail Price) if it is fixed by the Government. If MRP is not fixed, then the quoted price should not be more than prevailing market price. <p>Therefore, grievance of the firm is accepted and the status of the firm M/s Certopharma is declared as Responsive against its grievance application.</p>
07	M/s Sharooq Pharma	Allout Hand Sanitizer Gel	Non-Responsive	The sample of quoted product is in gel form of hand sanitizer whereas the DRAP has enlisted the liquid form of hand sanitizer against the given Enlistment/DML No. for quoted item of manufacturer. Hence does	The firm submitted the grievance against the technical evaluation report with the following points: Firm has registered/enlist Hand sanitizer in Gel as well in liquid form. (Copy of DRAP	The representative of M/s Sharooq Pharma attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report.

				not conform to given specifications	enlistment letter Reg. 0217720) is attached in their technical Bid.) Firm also quoted KN95 face mask with respirator and without respirator. We have attached required certificates (complies EN149+:2001 +A1:2009) with technical bids. So kindly re-evaluate.	The committee after due deliberation and discussion, accepted the grievance of the firm, keeping in view the DRAP enlistment. Hence the status of the firm M/s Sharooq Pharma is declared as Responsive against its grievance application.
	M/s Sharooq Pharma	KN95 Without Respirator	Non-Responsive	The sample of quoted product does not conform to given specifications		The representative of M/s Sharooq Pharma also presented the grievance regarding KN 95 with & without respirator.
	M/s Sharooq Pharma	KN95 With Respirator	Non-Responsive	The sample of quoted product does not conform to given specifications		The grievance of KN 95 with & without respirator is not accepted by the grievance committee after due deliberation and discussion. Hence the status of the firm M/s Sharooq Pharma is declared as Non-Responsive against its grievance application.
08	M/s Jam Sung Pvt. Ltd	Zestize IPA Hand Sanitizer	Non-Responsive	The sample of quoted product is of 1000ml pack size. Hence does not conform to given specifications.	The firm submitted the grievance against the technical evaluation report that the firm submitted the sample of in pack of 1000 ml and on the base of pack size committee disqualified the firm, now the firm submitting the sample of 500 ml pack size with the grievance letter. Please consider the sample and qualify the firm technically.	The grievance redressal committee examined the submitted grievance of the M/s Jam Sung Pvt. Ltd. in the light of Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the COVID-19 emergency timelines decided to not accept the sample i.e. 500 ml of pack size, presented before the grievance redressal. Therefore, grievance of the firm is not accepted. Hence the status of the firm M/s Jam Sung Pvt. Ltd is declared as Non-Responsive against its grievance application.
09	M/s MK Traders	1. Surgical Masks	Non-Responsive	No Technical Offer submitted by the firm	M/s MK Traders We have participated in the RFQ Phase-IV, for the Serial 1) supply of N95 masks & Serial 2) supply of Surgical masks, to your esteemed department submitted on 28th April 2020.	The grievance redressal committee examined the submitted grievance of the M/s MK Traders in the light of Technical Evaluation report as well as sample evaluation report.

					<p>The official website has uploaded the technical evaluation report of the above mentioned RFQ Phase-IV which indicates that M/S MK Traders has submitted "No Technical offer". Whereas we have submitted all the relevant documents including all undertakings on judicial papers, CNIC of the owner, NTN & STRN verification certificate, product brochures and pictures along with our technical and financial quotation. You are kindly requested to inform us our shortcomings/discrepancies in the submitted technical bid so that these shortcomings may be avoided in future.</p>	<p>The committee after due deliberation and discussion decided that the grievance of the firm is not accepted in the light of abovementioned technical reports.</p> <p>Hence the status of the firm M/s MK Traders is declared as Non-Responsive against its grievance application.</p>
10	M/s Carevell	<p>1. KN95 Face Masks 2. Local Face Shield</p>	Non-Responsive	<p>The sample of quoted product does not conform to given specifications.</p>	<p>M/s Carevell The firm submitted the grievance against the technical evaluation report and stated that; 1.KN95 grade masks complies to EN 149 standards as demanded in advertised specification. Further the product has completed FDA establishment registration and device listing with US food & Drug administration which is a plus point. Certificates copies are already attached with technical offer further attached for your kind consideration. 2.The firm quoted the Face Shield as per international standards manufactured in Pakistan. In advertise specification 20-40</p>	<p>The representative of M/s Carevell attended the meeting and presented their grievance to the grievance redressal committee. The committee heard the view point of the representative of the firm which was examined in the light of Technical Evaluation Report.</p> <p>The committee after due deliberation and discussion, keeping in view the required parameters in detail as well as specifications decided that the grievance of firm is not accepted.</p> <p>Hence the status of the firm M/s Carevell is declared as Non-Responsive against its grievance application.</p>

					<p>micrometers thickness is demanded but we have offered 2mm which is durable and better than advertised specifications.</p> <p>The firm requested that please review the technical evaluation as well as sample evaluation.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Senior Law Officer, DGHS
(Member)

Director Pharmacy, DGHS
(Member)

Director Health Services (CD&EPC), DGHS
(Convener)