



## PURCHASE CELL

DIRECTORATE GENERAL HEALTH  
SERVICES PUNJAB  
24-COOPER ROAD, LAHORE



Primary & Secondary  
Healthcare Department

Phone No.: [+924299201145](tel:+924299201145)

Purchase Cell E-mail: [pcdghslahore@gmail.com](mailto:pcdghslahore@gmail.com)

### **MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL COMMITTEE HELD ON 06<sup>th</sup> JANUARY, 2020 AT 02:00 P.M TO REDRESS THE GRIEVANCE APPLICATIONS OF THE FIRMS AGAINST PRE-QUALIFICATION EVALUATION REPORT FOR PROCUREMENT OF MANAGEMENT & OPERATION OF HOSPITAL WASTE SERVICES IN HEALTHCARE FACILITIES, HEPATITIS PREVENTION & INFECTION CONTROL PROGRAM, DIRECTORATE GENERAL HEALTH SERVICES, PUNJAB, FY 2019-20**

A meeting of the Grievance Redressal Committee was held on 06-01-2020 at 02:00 P.M in Committee Room of Directorate General Health Services, Punjab, to address the grievances of the applicants, as per Rule 67 of Punjab Procurement Rules, 2014 (Amended), for Procurement of Management & Operation of Hospital Waste Services in Healthcare Facilities, Hepatitis Prevention & Infection Control Program, Directorate General Health Services, Punjab, FY 2019-20.

Following members of Grievance Redressal Committee attended the meeting:

Sr. No.	Participants	
1.	Director Health Services (EPI), DGHS	<b>Chairman/Convener</b>
2.	Director Health Services (P&D), DGHS	<b>Member</b>
3.	Senior Law Officer (Litigation Cell), DGHS	<b>Member</b>
4.	Program Manager, Provincial T.B Control Program, DGHS	<b>Member</b>
5.	Secretary Purchase Cell, DGHS	<b>Member</b>
6.	Purchase Officer (PHCP), DGHS	<b>Co-opted Member</b>

Following member(s) of the PQ Evaluation Committee presented the cases on behalf of the Committee:

Sr. No.	Member
1.	Deputy Director Pharmacy, DGHS

The Chair welcomed all the participants and briefed about agenda of meeting i.e. Grievance Redressal of firms against announced PQ Evaluation Report.

The Chair instructed the representatives of aggrieved firms to come one by one serial wise based on receipt of grievance so that proper hearing/ redressal of grievance may be ensured. The grievances of firms and decisions of grievance redressal committee are as follow:

Sr.	Name of Firm	Reason(s) of Rejection	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
1	M/s G Med Pvt. Ltd.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. No evidence provided regarding experience of managing a fleet of at least 30 vehicles in ten or more districts in a province.</li> <li>2. Attested copies of qualification credentials of given list of staff not provided.</li> <li>3. Income Tax Return for the last three financial years not provided.</li> <li>4. Minimum Annual Turnover of firm/JV/Consortium/Proprietor/AOP/Pvt./Ltd. for any single financial year does not meet requirement of 500 million.</li> </ol>	<p>The firm has submitted its grievance stating that:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. It has attached the order of PMU and P&amp;SHD for services of "End to End Fleet Management including Logistic, Fleet Management, warehousing/storage, Transportation &amp; Distribution in the name of its Joint Venture/Partner. Furthermore, the letters from the department regarding the shifting of medicine and their distribution plan of more than 30 district Hospitals also attached. Hence have an experience of a fleet of more than 30 vehicles.</li> <li>2. The attested copies of its staff has been attached for kind consideration.</li> <li>3. The income tax returns of M/s TCS (JV) for last three financial years attached.</li> <li>4. The income tax returns of M/s TCS (JV) has been provided which fulfil the said requirement.</li> </ol>	<p>Mr. Umair Iqbal, representative of <b>M/s G Med Pvt. Ltd.</b> attended the meeting. The committee scrutinized the documents submitted by the firm along with its grievance application in the light of PQ Evaluation Report.</p> <p>The committee after due deliberation and discussion at length, unanimously decided to accept:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. The work orders issued by PMU and P&amp;SHD for services of "End to End Fleet Management including Logistic, Fleet Management, warehousing/storage, Transportation &amp; Distribution in the name of its Joint Venture/Partner M/s TCS Logistics as evidence for experience of managing a fleet of at least 30 vehicles in ten or more districts in a province.</li> <li>ii. Attested copies of qualification credentials of given list of staff.</li> <li>iii. Income Tax Return for the last three financial years of both JV firms.</li> <li>iv. Submitted Income tax returns of JV illustrate that requirement of Minimum Annual Turnover of 500 million has been fulfilled.</li> </ol> <p>Thus, grievance of the firm is accepted and status of the firm M/s G Med Pvt. Ltd. is declared as "<b>Pre-qualified</b>".</p>
2	M/s Epic Consulting Pvt. Ltd.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. No evidence provided regarding experience of managing a fleet of at least 30 vehicles in ten or more districts in a province.</li> <li>3. Minimum Annual Turnover of firm/JV/Consortium/Proprietor/AOP/Pvt./Ltd. for any single financial year does not meet requirement of 500 million.</li> <li>4. Undertakings for debarment, blacklisting or ineligibility by any public sector organization of Pakistan, conformity with PHWM rules 2014 &amp; acceptance of all terms &amp; conditions are not signed/provided for all JV/Consortium firms.</li> </ol>	<p>The firm has submitted its grievance stating that:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. M/s Megatech trackers have experience of managing a fleet of at least 30 vehicles. Related documents have been attached for kind perusal.</li> <li>3. Minimum annual turnover of 500 million is met in the FY 2018-19 for only 2 partner firms. Filling of income tax returns for rest of the firms is still under process (last date is Dec 31, 2019), adding which the total turnover will be much more than the requirement</li> </ol>	<p>Mr. Adnan Waris, representative of <b>M/s Epic consulting Pvt. Ltd.</b> attended the meeting. The committee scrutinized the documents submitted by the firm along with its grievance application in the light of PQ Evaluation Report and found that although:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. JV has fulfilled the requirement of Minimum Annual Turnover of 500 million.</li> </ol>

Sr.	Name of Firm	Reason(s) of Rejection	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
		<p>5. No evidence of NTN/GST registration, PRA registration, income tax returns and other relevant documents of JV firm M/s Megatech Trackers not provided.</p> <p>6. ISO 9001 Certificate of lead firm not provided.</p>	<p>4. Original undertaking already signed by the lead bidder (authorized by the partner firms through JV Agreement) attached with proposal.</p> <p>5. The related documents have been attached herewith for kind perusal.</p> <p>6. ISO 9001 certificate attached for JV partner. As per the evaluation criteria, it was not required specifically for the lead firm.</p>	<p>ii. JV has provided the required documents of JV firm M/s Megatech Trackers.</p> <p>iii. ISO 9001 certificate was not required specifically for the lead firm.</p> <p>But as it has failed to provide any evidence regarding experience of managing a fleet of at least 30 vehicles in ten or more districts in a province as well as neither undertakings for debarment, blacklisting or ineligibility by any public sector organization of Pakistan, conformity with PHWM rules 2014 &amp; acceptance of all terms &amp; conditions were signed/provided for all JV/Consortium firms nor any evidence of "Power of Attorney" was furnished.</p> <p>Therefore, the committee after due deliberation and discussion at length, unanimously decided to reject the grievance of the firm.</p> <p>Thus, status of the firm M/s Epic Consulting Pvt. Ltd. is declared as "<b>Not Pre-qualified</b>".</p>
3	M/s Eastern Medical Technology Services	<p>1. No evidence provided regarding experience of managing a fleet of at least 30 vehicles in ten or more districts in a province.</p> <p>2. Attested copies of qualification credentials of given list of staff of M/s Balaji Enterprises not provided.</p> <p>3. Minimum Annual Turnover of firm/JV/Consortium/Proprietor/AOP/Pvt./Ltd. for any single financial year does not meet requirement of 500 million.</p> <p>4. Undertakings for debarment, blacklisting or ineligibility by any public sector organization of Pakistan, conformity with PHWM rules 2014 &amp; acceptance of all terms &amp; conditions are not signed/provided for all JV/Consortium firms as well as not notarized.</p>	<p>The firm has submitted its grievance stating that:</p> <p>1. Work orders of M/s Balaji Enterprises has been attached regarding experience of maintaining and managing fleet of 30 vehicles in different districts of Sindh for management of Hospital Waste.</p> <p>2. Attested credentials of employees have been submitted for perusal.</p> <p>3. Annual turnover exceeding remained Rs. 500 million per annum during last three years. To substantiate, audit reports of EMTS have been annexed.</p> <p>4. All the JV firms gave "Power of Attorney" to Mr. M. Abubakr Shahid S/o Ghulam Nabi Shahid to sign the documents on their behalf and judicial stamp papers were duly signed &amp; stamped by the same. Power of Attorney letter &amp; notarized judicial stamp papers have been attached.</p>	<p>Mr. Abubakar Shahid, representative of <b>M/s Eastern Medical Technology Services</b>, attended the meeting. The committee scrutinized the documents submitted by the firm along with its grievance application in the light of PQ Evaluation Report and found that although:</p> <p>i. JV has fulfilled the requirement of experience of managing a fleet of at least 30 vehicles in ten or more districts in a province simultaneously.</p> <p>ii. JV firms gave "Power of Attorney" to Mr. M. Abubakr Shahid S/o Ghulam Nabi Shahid to sign the documents on their behalf and same has been submitted along with judicial stamp papers (Undertakings) duly signed &amp; stamped.</p>

Sr.	Name of Firm	Reason(s) of Rejection	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
				<p>iii. Attested copies of qualification credentials of given list of staff of M/s Balaji Enterprises were provided.</p> <p>But as it has failed to provide requisite FBR Document exhibiting the Annual Turnover of JV firms. Therefore, the committee after due deliberation and discussion at length, unanimously decided to reject the grievance of the firm.</p> <p>Thus, status of the firm M/s Eastern Medical Technology Services is declared as <b>“Not Pre-qualified”</b>.</p>
4.	M/s Arar Innovations Pvt. Ltd.		<p>The firm has submitted its grievance stating that the following points must also be considered in addition to points highlighted in evaluation report: <b><u>M/s G Med (Pvt.) Ltd.:</u></b> The said firm has won the award of laundry services of the 12-13 districts but the firm is providing services only in 3-4 districts of Punjab. This may be verified from PMU and P&amp;SHD. Moreover, the said firm has no experience in provision of clinical services. M/s G Med has established JV with M/s TCS Logistics who is responsible for provision of services for transportation of goods from warehouse to different districts of Punjab which is totally different from hospital waste management. So, the said firm must be disqualified on the grounds as mentioned. <b><u>M/s Epic Consulting:</u></b> The said firm is a Human Resource outsourcing firm therefore it has not experience of health related operations and management services/waste management in at least ten districts of the province simultaneously. Moreover, the said firm has no experience in provision of clinical services. In addition, the company has come up with the JV of five other companies which also do not have relevant experience in this specific filed of infectious waste management. It is hereby pertinent to note that as per PPRR Rules of Procurement,</p>	<p>Mr. Ammar Azhar, representative of <b>M/s Arar Innovations Pvt. Ltd.</b>, attended the meeting. The committee scrutinized its grievance application and heard view point of the firm in the light of PQ Evaluation Report and found that: M/s G Med has submitted signed contract regarding Provision of Operation and Management of Laundry Services in DHQ/THQ Hospitals of the Punjab from which it is evident that the same has installed its units/feeders in 3 districts but providing services to health facilities of nearby districts as well which sum up to 12-13 districts thereby fulfilling the required criteria. The grievance of the firm with respect to JV of M/s G Med (Pvt.) Ltd. &amp; M/s TCS Logistics is baseless as it fulfills the requirement of Evaluation Criteria regarding experience of managing a fleet of at least 30 vehicles in ten or more districts in a province. Since delivery of medicine to health facilities is also health related service. Therefore, on above grounds the grievance of the firm is rejected with respect to M/d G Med Pvt. Ltd. As far as grievance against M/s Epic is concerned, it had submitted contract awards for provision of Janitorial</p>

Sr.	Name of Firm	Reason(s) of Rejection	Grievance of the Firm	Decision of the Committee
			<p>the joint venture of maximum four companies is allowed. Thus the said firm should also be disqualified on these points as well.</p>	<p>Services in Health Facilities of Punjab as evidence of experience of health related operations and management services/waste management in at least ten districts of the province simultaneously which was considered by PQ Evaluation Committee. Moreover, upon inquiring about reference of rule of PPR-2014 concerning limitation in joint venture of maximum four companies by the Grievance Redressal Committee, the representative of the firm was unable to cite any such provision in governing rules. Thus, grievance of the firm with respect to M/s Epic Consulting is rejected on basis of above mentioned reasons.</p>

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Secretary Purchase Cell, DGHS**  
**(Member)**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Purchase Officer (PHCP), DGHS**  
**(Co-opted Member)**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Senior Law Officer, DGHS**  
**(Member)**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Program Manager, Provincial T.B Control Program**  
**(Member)**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Director Health Services (P&D), DGHS**  
**(Member)**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Director Health Services (EPI), DGHS**  
**(Convener)**