



**DIRECTORATE GENERAL
HEALTH SERVICES PUNJAB**
24-COOPERROAD, LAHORE
Phone: +924299201145
E-mail- pcdghslahore@gmail.com



Primary & Secondary
Healthcare Department

MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL COMMITTEE HELD ON 15th NOVEMBER 2023 AT 11:00 A.M. TO REDRESS THE GRIEVANCE APPLICATIONS OF THE FIRMS AGAINST TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT OF REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL PHASE-III (DRUGS/MEDICINES, MEDICAL DEVICES AND SURGICAL DRESSINGS) (FINANCIAL YEAR 2023-24)

A meeting of the Grievance Redressal Committee was held on 15-11-2023 at 11:00 A.M in committee room of Directorate General Health Services, Punjab, to address the grievances of the applicants, as per Rule 67 of Punjab Procurement Rules, 2014 (Amended), for Procurement of Drugs/Medicines, Medical Devices including and Surgical Dressings, Directorate General Health Services, Punjab, FY 2023-24.

Following were the members of Grievance Redressal Committee:

Sr.	Participants	
1.	Program Director IRMNCH & NP	Chairman/Convener
2.	Director Health Services (CD & EPC) O/o Director General Health Services, Punjab	Member
3.	Additional Director (EPI) O/o Director General Health Services, Punjab	Member
4.	Deputy Program Manager (NCD) O/o Director General Health Services, Punjab	Member
5.	Senior Law Officer O/o Director General Health Services, Punjab	Member

The Chair welcomed all the participants and briefed about agenda of meeting i.e., Grievance Redressal of firms against Technical Evaluation Report for the Procurement of Drugs/Medicines, Medical Devices and Surgical Dressings, FY 2023-24. The Chair instructed the representatives of aggrieved firms to come one by one serial wise so that proper hearing/ redressal of grievance may be ensured. The grievances of firms and decisions of grievance redressal committee are as follow:

MINUTES OF MEETING OF GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL COMMITTEE AGAINST TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT FOR REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL PHASE-III (DRUGS/MEDICINES, MEDICAL DEVICES AND SURGICAL DRESSINGS) (FINANCIAL YEAR 2023-24)

Sr. No	Name of Firm	Item name	Reason for Rejection	Grievance of Firm	Decision of the Committee
1	Bloom Pharmaceuticals (Pvt) Ltd	Fusidic acid 2% +hydrocortisone1 % cream	1. The quoted item not complies 100% with the advertised specifications	<p>The Technical Evaluation Committee of DGHS Punjab has given us 43 marks but declared Non-responsive on basis that quoted item not complies 100% with the advertised specifications. It is humbly stated that the Pre-qualification Committee of DGHS Punjab has Pre-qualified our medicine fusidic acid 20mg +hydrocortisone 10mg cream against the advertised specification because the specification of our medicine 100% complies with the advertised specifications.</p> <p>The arithmetical explanation is given below Each gram contains: Fusidic Acid 20mg (which is equivalent to 2%) Hydrocortisone.....10mg (which is equivalent to 1%)</p> <p>Fusidic Acid 1 gram contains = 1000mg 2% means= 2/100 mg 2% of 1gm= 2/100 (1000)mg=20mg</p> <p>Hydrocortisone 1 gram contains = 1000mg 1% means= 1/100mg 1% of 1gm= 1/100(1000)mg = 10mg</p> <p>It is further stated that for the FY 2022-23 we have awarded 42525 Tubes of Austafus-H Cream from DGHS Punjab on the same specification and successfully supplied the same quantity. The copy of supply Order and Delivery Challan Attached herewith for ready reference. In the light of above fact, it is request that Technical Evaluation Committee may be requested to review their decision and declared us responsive against the said medicine.</p>	<p>Mr. Qaisar Iqbal from M/s Bloom Pharmaceuticals (Pvt) Ltd attended the meeting. The committee examined the grievance application submitted by the firm in light of the advertised Evaluation Criteria & Specifications and announced the Technical Evaluation Report.</p> <p>The committee after due deliberation and discussion decided that: 1. The strength of the quoted item is as per advertised specifications and the firm provided the undertaking regarding the supply of the quoted item as per advertised specifications (i.e., 15g); hence, the grievance of the firm was accepted to the extent of this parameter. Hence, the status of the quoted item changed to Responsive.</p>
2	Nabiqasim Industries (Private) Limited	Sodium Phosphate Enema (Liquid)	1. The quoted item not complies 100% with the advertised specifications.	<p>Valid DRC of quoted pack size is attached.</p> <p>We are submitting the relevant documents about its specification (Please Revalidate)</p> <p>In the light of above mentioned provided documents. It is requested to please give additional mark in our above mentioned items of said technical offer for healthy competition and in the best interest of need peoples.</p> <p>Your cooperation in this regard will be much appreciated.</p>	<p>Mr. Asim from M/s Nabiqasim Industries (Private) Limited attended the meeting. The committee examined the grievance application submitted by the firm in light of the advertised Evaluation Criteria & Specifications and announced the Technical Evaluation Report.</p> <p>The committee after due deliberation and discussion decided that: 1. The firm provided the leaflet specimen and the undertaking regarding the supply of the stock of the quoted item with leaflet as per advertised specifications; hence, the grievance of the firm was accepted to the extent of this parameter. Hence, the status of the quoted item changed to Responsive.</p>
3	AGP Limited	Amoxicillin (as trihydrate) 500mg + Clavulanic Acid (as Potassium) 125mg Tab/Cap	1. The quoted item did not obtain the qualifying marks.	<p>AMMOXICILLIN (AS TRIHYDRATE) 500MG + CLAVULANIC ACID (AS POTASSIUM) 125MG TAB/CAP was declared "Non-Responsive" on the pretext "The Quoted item did not obtain the qualifying Marks". We wish to submit the following:</p> <p>1. Waste Water Treatment Plant: We submitted the Waste water along with our bid but were not granted any marks. We are enclosing herewith following documents to substantiate our claim for Waste Water Treatment Plant: i. SOP for the Waste Water Treatment. ii. Complete Layout and Flowchart of the waste water system. iii. Photographs of the plant. iv. Copy of Disclaimer / Pre-Commissioning Checks & manual for operations etc., from M/s WEMS (Vender). v. Approval letter from Environment Protection Department. vi. Test reports of water from PCSIR. vii. Water Neutralization Log Sheets for Aug-23, Sept-23 & Oct-23 You are requested to kindly grant us 3 marks for the said parameter.</p> <p>2. Availability of Product at Chain Pharmacies: We are attaching Invoices of following Chain Pharmacies for Tab. Amoxi-Clav 625mg.:</p> <p>i. Clinix Plus Pharmacy ii. Green Plus Pharmacie iii. Fazal Din & Pharma Plus iv. Servaid Pharmacy v. D. Watsons Pharmacy vi. Shaheen Chemists. You are requested to kindly grant us 5 marks for the said parameter.</p>	<p>Mr. M. Mashood Khan from M/s AGP Limited attended the meeting. The committee examined the grievance application submitted by the firm in light of the advertised Evaluation Criteria & Specifications and announced the Technical Evaluation Report.</p> <p>The committee after due deliberation and discussion decided that: 1. The firm provided flow sheet diagram, SOPs, real time pictures and monthly log sheets for waste water treatment plant, which was accepted; hence, 03 marks were awarded to the extent of this parameter. 2. The firm provided chain pharmacy data of the quoted item, which was accepted; hence, additional 02 marks were awarded to the extent of this parameter. Hence, total marks of the quoted item became 44 and status of the quoted item changed to Responsive.</p>

4	Hiranis Pharmaceuticals (Pvt.) Ltd	Escitalopram Tab/Cap 10mg	1. The quoted item did not obtain the qualifying marks	<p>Respected Sir, This refers to RFP Technical Evaluation Report Drugs/Medicines (Phase II) 2023-24 in which you were disqualified our following quoted products for the following clauses, In this regard we are respectfully submitting our replies for the removal of those objections as follows: 1. REASON I REMARKS: Number of Functional Stability Chambers REPLY: We would like to inform you that we have already submitted undertaking on notarized stamp paper and relevant valid calibration/validation report of 08 Stability chambers in tender documents (Page # 230-358) but despite of submitting above we don't have obtain marks of said clause. We hereby once again attached the undertaking on notarized stamp paper along with calibration/validation report of 08 stability chambers in Annex-A for your further deliberation. Annex A. 2. REASON/ REMARKS: Availability of Products (Retail Chain) Tab. Escitalopram 10mg (DUOPRAM). Cream. Fusidic Acid + Hydrocortisone Acetate 20mg/10mg (HIFUZIN HC CREAM). Tab. Naproxen Sodium 550mg (GIA). REPLY: We would like to inform you that we don't have obtain the marks despite of submission chain pharmacy record/invoices of above mentioned products in tender documents (Page # 553-598). Now we are submitting once again chain pharmacy invoices of above products for your consideration. Annex B. 3. REASON / REMARKS: Waste Water Treatment Plant REPLY: We have submitted Waste Water Treatment Plant S.O.P and Layout Plan in tender documents (Page# 226-228). However, we are once again submitting Waste Water Treatment Plant S.O.P and Layout Plan for your kind consideration. Annex-C. 4. REASON / REMARKS: Valid ISO 14001 (EMS Certificate)V Tab. Naproxen Sodium 550mg (GIA). REPLY: We have submitted Valid ISO 14001 (EMS Certificate) and you were give us 0 marks instead of 03 marks in our above quoted product. However, we are once again submitting Valid ISO 14001 for your kind consideration. Annex-D. 5. REASON / REMARKS: Source of API Tab. Escitalopram 10mg (DUOPRAM). Cream. Fusidic Acid + Hydrocortisone Acetate 200mg/10mg (HIFUZIN HC CREAM). REPLY: We would like to inform you that our API source of above quoted product is FDA approved source but you were gave us 05 marks instead of 10 marks in API Source documents. However, we are submitting once again complete API source documents along with FDA Certificate. (Annex-E).</p>	<p>Mr. Rashid Butt from M/s Hiranis Pharmaceuticals (Pvt.) Ltd attended the meeting. The committee examined the grievance application submitted by the firm in light of the advertised Evaluation Criteria & Specifications and announced the Technical Evaluation Report. The committee after due deliberation and discussion decided that: 1. The firm provided the calibration certificates of 08 functional stability chambers, which were accepted; hence, 06 marks were awarded to the extent of this parameter. 2. The firm provided documents regarding API source of FDA approved, which were not accepted; hence, the grievance of the firm was not accepted to the extent of this parameter. 3. The firm provided the SOPs and layout plan of waste water treatment plant, which were not accepted; hence the grievance of the firm was not accepted to the extent of this parameter. 4. The firm provided the invoices data for availability of the quoted item at retail chain pharmacies, which was accepted; hence 05 marks were awarded to the extent of this parameter. Hence, the total marks of the quoted item became 48 and the status of the quoted item changed to Responsive.</p>
5	Hiranis Pharmaceuticals (Pvt.) Ltd	Fusidic acid 2% +hydrocortisone1 % cream+C6:E8	1. The quoted item did not obtain the qualifying marks	<p>Tab. Naproxen Sodium 550mg (GIA). REPLY: We have submitted Valid ISO 14001 (EMS Certificate) and you were give us 0 marks instead of 03 marks in our above quoted product. However, we are once again submitting Valid ISO 14001 for your kind consideration. Annex-D. 5. REASON / REMARKS: Source of API Tab. Escitalopram 10mg (DUOPRAM). Cream. Fusidic Acid + Hydrocortisone Acetate 200mg/10mg (HIFUZIN HC CREAM). REPLY: We would like to inform you that our API source of above quoted product is FDA approved source but you were gave us 05 marks instead of 10 marks in API Source documents. However, we are submitting once again complete API source documents along with FDA Certificate. (Annex-E).</p>	<p>1. The firm provided the calibration certificates of 08 functional stability chambers, which were accepted; hence, 06 marks were awarded to the extent of this parameter. 2. The firm provided documents regarding API source of FDA approved, which were accepted; hence additional 05 marks were awarded to the extent of this parameter. 3. The firm provided the SOPs and layout plan of waste water treatment plant, which were not accepted; hence the grievance of the firm was not accepted to the extent of this parameter. 4. The firm provided the invoices data for availability of the quoted item at retail chain pharmacies, which was accepted; hence 05 marks were awarded to the extent of this parameter. Hence, the total marks of the quoted item became 51 and the status of the quoted item changed to Responsive.</p>
6	Hiranis Pharmaceuticals (Pvt.) Ltd	Naproxen Sodium 550mg Tab/Cap (equivalent to 500mg Naproxen)	1. The quoted item did not obtain the qualifying marks		<p>1. The firm provided the calibration certificates of 08 functional stability chambers, which were accepted; hence, 06 marks were awarded to the extent of this parameter. 2. The firm provided valid ISO 14001 certificate, which was accepted; hence 03 marks were awarded to the extent of this parameter. 3. The firm provided the SOPs and layout plan of waste water treatment plant, which were not accepted; hence the grievance of the firm was not accepted to the extent of this parameter. 4. The firm provided the invoices data for availability of the quoted item at retail chain pharmacies, which was accepted; hence 05 marks were awarded to the extent of this parameter. Hence, the total marks of the quoted item became 51 and the status of the quoted item changed to Responsive.</p>